Article: A Comparative Study of the Personality Formulates of Ghazali and Freud

Author(s): Hanna-e-Kalbi, Tahira Basharat

Published: Fall 2020

Article DOI: https://doi.org/10.32350/jitc.102.13


Crossref

Copyright Information: This article is open access and is distributed under the terms of Creative Commons Attribution – Share Alike 4.0 International License

Publisher Information: Department of Islamic Thought and Civilization, School of Social Science and Humanities, University of Management and Technology, Lahore, Pakistan.

For more please click here
A Comparative Study of the Personality Traits of Ghazali and Freud

Hanna-e-Kalbi*  
Institute of Islamic Perspective and Guidance (IIPG)  
University of Management and Technology, Lahore, Pakistan  

Tahira Basharat  
Department of Islamic Thought and Civilization  
University of Management and Technology, Lahore, Pakistan  

Abstract

This research is a comparative study of traits of personality by Ghazali and Freud. Traits of personality to Ghazali are “al-nafs al-ammara, al-nafs al-lawwama and al-nafs al-mutma’inna,” and according to Freud are: Id, ego and super-ego. Rooh, qalb (heart), and aql (mind) play a role in shaping the traits of personality. All of the traits of the personality work together in conscious, subconscious and unconscious mind. Ghazali and other Muslim philosophers and theologians were influenced by the basic sources of Islam, the Qur’ān and the Sunnah. In their view the traits of personality, having roots in the Qur’ān are irrefutable yet unverifiable. On the contrary Freud is an atheist, having a proud Jewish background gives a model of the opaque “parts of the personality.” This model distinguishes him from all of the western psychologists. His parts of personality are found to be much similar to Ghazali’s traits of personality. Freud’s model lacks only al-nafs al-mutma’inna. His super-ego is comprised of both the conscience and the ideal self. Al-nafs al-lawwama is the conscience self, which is the part of the super-ego. This research will thematically and comparatively study the differences between the Ghazali’s and Freud’s traits of personality. Comparison of the traits of personality presented by Ghazali and Freud coming from two different backgrounds: religion and atheism, makes this research unique. It may help the scholars to bring about more productive discussions in the field of psychology.  

Keywords: The Qur’ān, Sunnah, ID, ego and super-ego, nafs, nafs ammara, nafs lawwama, nafs mutma’inna.

Introduction

The Qur’ān and the Sunnah, sources of knowledge in Islam, influenced Ghazali (1058-1111 AD) and other Muslim philosophers as well as theologians. According to these scholars, traits of personality, having roots in the Qur’ān are though irrefutable, yet unverifiable. On the contrary, Freud, an atheist with Jewish origin, talks about the unseen

*Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Hanna-e-Kalbi, Assistant Professor, Institute of Islamic Perspective and Guidance (IIPG), University of Management and Technology, Lahore at hanna.kalbi@umt.edu.pk
“parts of the personality.” With these backdrops in mind, this article will define the traits of personality, presented by Ghazali and Freud and discuss their function along with the differences and similarities. This study discovers much similarity in the personality formulations presented by both these scholars. Although Id and al-nafs al-ammara are the same, al-nafs al-lawwama consists of ego and super-ego. However, only Islamic theology discusses al-nafs al-mutma’inah.

For centuries, relations between God, man and the universe, initially known as philosophy, have been a major field of study. Psychology evolved as a science to study human behavior.1 Psychology is derived from psyche-logos, meaning “the study of the soul.” Psychology became popular in the 19th century. Philosophers and theologians talk about the unseen and the soul whereas, Psychology uses the word “mind” instead. It is also defined as the study of human behavior.2 Before moving on to the traits of personality by Ghazali and Freud, the two scholars are briefly introduced.

1.1. Ghazali and Freud

Abu Hamid Muhammad al-Ghazali (1058-1111 A.D.), lived in Tus, Iran. His God gifted intellect won him high status among the scholars. He taught at the University of Baghdad. He responsibly struggled to live by his knowledge and words. For the same purpose he left his highly paid job, cut off from people and became a genitor at a mosque in Syria. He went to Makkah for Hajj. For 10 years, he contemplated and trained his nafs (self/soul). He kept learning and writing. He, then, realizing that he has duty towards his family too, came back after ten years, and spent the remaining years of his life teaching students of various fields of interest. He is buried in Tus.3 His major works, important for this paper are: Ihya ’Uloom-ul-Deen, [The Revival of Religious Sciences] and Kemiya-e-Sa’adat [Alchemy of Happiness]. He has discussed the personality traits i.e., human desires, challenges to be faced, reasons for and ways of acquiring happiness and salvation in great detail.

Sigmund Freud (1856-1939) lived in Moravia, Czechoslovakia. He was born in a Jewish family. In the 19th century, he with his family had to migrate to Vienna on account of Jewish massacre by Hitler. He believed that contributing to the society will win him acceptance. He abandoned Judaism for the fear of burning in the hell and became an atheist. He was a neurologist, a vigilant student of Charcot (1825-1893). He accompanied Charcot in lectures and treatment of the patients. Freud was the founder of Psychoanalysis. His studies revolve around the unseen forces as undeniable facts. In 1900, he wrote The

---

2Ibid.
Interpretation of Dreams to understand human psychology. Initially people denied it, later it gained enough popularity to be translated into many languages with several editions. The Ego and the Id, Dissection of Personality, and Totem and Taboo are his major works and are helpful in this research.

The Muslim philosophers take the concepts of the types of personality (nafs): al-nafs al-ammara, al-nafs al-lawwamah and al-nafs al-mutma’innah, from the basic sources of Islam, the Qur’ān and the Sunnah. Therefore, same are the sources for Ghazali. The thoughts of Ghazali have been chosen for this research because he is distinguished scholar for his in-depth writings about nafs and its training. One complete volume of Ihya’ ul uloom-ud-Deen is dedicated solely to this topic. Kemiya-e-Sa’adat is a book summary of the four volumes of Ihya ‘Uloom-ud-Deen which guides the reader through all the instinctive emotions and desires of a person.

Freud is the Psychologist who came up with the theory of Psychoanalysis under which he discovered three parts of personality i.e., ID, Ego and Super-ego, and worked on the three stages of memory, Conscious, Subconscious and Unconscious. His psychology is said to be the psychology of Unconscious because, according to him, human conduct is based on the childhood experiences and parent’s symptoms, dreams and therapeutic thought. He was born to a Jewish family, but he became an atheist and lived in the shadow of Austrian and German anti-Semitism. All the Semitic religions have common basis of beliefs and moral values. It is quite possible that he was inspired by the religion in deriving the parts of personality because he denies the unseen yet he seems to believe in the physical and spiritual aspects of a personality.

1.2. Ghazali’s Traits of Personality

According to Ghazali there are two meanings of nafs- one is anger and sexual appetite in humans. Second meaning is the soul, said to be the self or the person. The self has three states: “al-nafs al-ammara, al-nafs al-lawwama and al-nafs al-mutma’innah. If the soul gives in to the evil passions, and it neither resists nor rebukes it, then it is “al-nafs al-ammara bi al-su’. If it slips into follies, and later it rebukes itself on doing wrong then it is called “al-nafs al-lawwama.” However, if a soul is in harmony with the commandments of God and is not disturbed by the passions, it is called “al-nafs al-mutma’innah.”

---

4Richard Wollheim, Sigmund Freud (USA: Cambridge University Press, 1971).
7Ibid.
9the self-accusing soul.
10the satisfied soul.
Ghazali derives the types of *nafs* from the Qurʾān: 1) “Indeed *nafs* overwhelmingly drives (*an-naf al-ammarah*) a person to sin except those to whom Allah is merciful.”11 2) “And nay I swear by *an-nafs al-lawwam a.*”12 3) “To the righteous it will be said “oh reassured soul (*an-nafs al-Mutmaínna*) , return to your Lord well pleased, and pleasing to Him.”13 *Nafs* is connected to *qalb*, ‘*Aql* and *rooh* which are closely linked with each other.

1. *Qalb* is the Arabic word for heart which means central and ever-changing.14 Such is the physical condition as well as spiritual condition of the heart. Physical heart is an organ to pump blood throughout the Body. Soul is the other meaning of *Qalb*. Soul is the invisible vibrant force, which is formless, having association with the physical heart.15

2. *Rooh* is something physical within the heart which vibrates the whole body like electric current and runs through the veins. It is called 'life.' The second meaning of *Rooh* is something spiritual which is called soul and not life. God says: “They ask you about *Rooh*. Say: It is a command from my Lord.”16

3. ‘*Aql*’ has numerous meanings but only two of them are common. The first meaning of ‘*Aql*’ is intellect which helps to understand the true nature of the material things which resides in the soul. The second meaning of ‘*Aql*’ is the power to understand the secrets of different learnings. That is knowledge which is an attribute. Attribute and the container are two different things. However, ‘*aql*’ or intellect is the name for both. As it has been mentioned in a saying of Muhammad (SAW), the first thing which God created is intellect.17 Knowledge is not tangible, however it cannot survive without the Physical intellect.18

Other than Ghazali, the authors chose Sigmund Freud for this paper. Freud was neither a philosopher nor a theologian. He was a psychologist, and the first one to propose psychoanalytical theory. During treatment of his patients, he discovered that there are three parts of personality: *Id*, *ego* and *super-ego*.

1.3. Freud’s Traits of Personality

According to Freud, *Id* is an instinctual drive. Hunger, thirst, anger and sexual appetite are from *Id*. It is the base of all the psychic energy. It works in the unconscious and is there

11Al-Qurʾān, Yusuf 12:53.
12Al-Qiyamah 75:2.
16Al-Isra 17:85.
18Ibid.
by birth. Hence, to him, it is the primary element of personality.\textsuperscript{19} The \textit{Ego} deals with the reality. It guides the \textit{Id} to act appropriately according to the societal norms—on the right time and at the right place. It functions in conscious, preconscious and unconscious mind. Like Ghazali, Freud symbolizes \textit{Id} and \textit{Ego} with a horse and its rider.\textsuperscript{20} Super-ego holds the sense of decision, moral values and that of right and wrong learnt from the parents.\textsuperscript{21} Super-ego makes one feel guilty for doing wrong and proud for doing good.

Where Ghazali talks about the function of the parts of self in connection with the heart, intellect and soul, Freud talks about the actions of the parts of personality in connection with the stages of memory and learning present in the un-conscious, subconscious and conscious mind along with their characteristics and habits in the early years of life and what form it takes with the passing years of physical and intellectual maturity.

Un-conscious mind holds the largest amount of data from our past consisting of memories, thoughts, desires and urges that a person is no more aware of. The unconscious comprises of the thoughts that are unacceptable or unpleasant like pain, anxiety or conflict. Sub-conscious mind consists of anything that could potentially be brought into the conscious mind. Conscious mind contains all of the thoughts, memories feelings and wishes of which we are aware at any given moment. This is the aspect of our mental processing that we can think of and talk about rationally. It also includes our memory which is not a part of consciousness but can be retrieved easily and brought into it.\textsuperscript{22}

This article aims at comparing the personality traits of Ghazali and Freud. The main focus is on the similarities and the found differences are intended on enhancing the knowledge. Comparison of the personality traits from different ideological backgrounds make this research unique.

2. Literature Review

The three types of \textit{nafs}: \textit{nafs ammara}, \textit{nafs lawwamah} and \textit{nafs mutma’inah} have always been a topic of discussion in the Muslim tradition. Many scholars have written about it. Mostly it is talked about in terms of character building of a person. Ibn-al-Qayyam al-Jawzi talks about it in his book “Patience and Gratitude” (School of Hope: 2018), Dr. Amin Ahsan Islahi “Tazkiya-e-Nafs,” Dr. Muhammad Amin “Tazkiya-e-Nafs,” Hamza Yousuf has written translation and commentary of Imam Al-Mawlu’d’s \textit{Matharat al Qulûb} as “Purification of the Heart.” Introduction to this book is about the physical heart to give better understanding of the spiritual heart. Kamal-ud-din’s lectures are available on

\textsuperscript{19}Sigmund Freud, \textit{The Ego and The ID}, 10.
\textsuperscript{20}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{21}Ibid., 17.
website. Abdul Hakeem Murad writes about Islamic spirituality and training the Ego. His lectures are available on YouTube. Late Syed Hakeem Muhammad Akhter has written a book on the diseases of the soul and its cure as “Rooh ki bimariyan aur un ka ilaj (Diseases of the Soul and its Cure).” He explains everything with the help of the Qur’ān and Sunnah and incidents from the lives of the saints who answered such questions of the people. Adamu Zakiyu Ubail and Abu Hakeem write, “The Effects of Spirituality in Shaping the Human Behavior-An Islamic Perspective (2015). This article is focused on identifying the influence of sources of Islamic spirituality on human behavior.

On the other side, much has been commented on Freud’s psychoanalysis in Jack Boozer’s article “Comments on "Religion, the Id, and the Superego.” “A History of Psychology” gives a great account of progress and formations in the field of Psychology. Freud’s psychoanalysis is discussed under the Psychology of Unconsciousness. “Sigmund Freud: Religion” on Internet Encyclopedia of Psychology (IEP) attempts to present the naturalistic account of religion presented by Freud’s psychoanalysis via study of all the important works Freud wrote. Will Herberg highly supports Freud’s view of “religion an illusion” in his article “The Study of Man: Freud, Religion and Social Reality” (1957). Jack Boozer in his article “Religion, the Id, and the Superego" goes against Freud’s pleasure principle of fulfilling the demands of ID, and emphasizes on the point that super-ego must be strengthened by training from childhood, and one’s spirit can be cured only when one stays away from wrong. Jack Boozer talks from Christian perspective. Omnia El Shakry in her book The Arabic Freud (2017) has written about the terms and concepts used in Arabic by Ibn-al-Arabi and other Arab writers mostly Egyptians.

Dr Rafi-ud-din, in his Ideology of the Future, has refuted the theories of Karl Marx (1818-1883), Freud, Adler (1870-1937) and McDougall (1871-1938), however, he compliments Freud’s extensive work on Psychoanalysis. Discussing the “Urge of instincts” Dr. Muhammad Rafi-ud-din says that Freud, Adler, McDougall, and Karl Marx agree that human instincts have urge for ideals but they differ on the source leading to the ideal.

Rafiuddin says that according to Freud the sexual urge provides man substitute activities like religion, art, morality and other professions. According to Adler the quest for ideals comes from “instinct of self-assertion.” When one is unable to fulfill one’s desire, this creates an alternative desire to satisfy the sense of inferiority.28

According to Muhammad Iqbal, human ego has to go through three states in order to be unique. First and foremost, one has to obey the law. Secondly, one should control one’s self. Controlling one’s self is the proof of the “highest form of self-consciousness or ego-hood.”29 Third is becoming the vicegerent of God on earth; vicegerent’s ego, according to Iqbal is the completest where heart and mind comes in harmony.30

Self-hood growth according to Iqbal has three levels.31 First, Self and I am-ness, in Maslow’s theory, hierarchy of needs, is the lowest level, where one cannot think beyond one’s self unless his psychological needs are met. Second, interpersonal comes from the sense of belonging that makes one’s relation with self and the society. Maslow suggests that “people have belonging and love needs” i.e., people see themselves in the opinion of others. The third level “the self and God” is the acknowledgement of God, it is, to see oneself in the light of God. This level can be linked to the “Need of self-actualization” in Maslow’s theory.32

Therefore, the first two levels33 of development of a personality or parts of personality are almost the same among Ghazali, Freud, Iqbal, Maslow, the Qur’an and the prophetic traditions. Difference lies at the third one; Iqbal and Ghazali relate it with harmonizing with God.34 However, to Freud super-ego holds the conscience and the ideal self. Conscience is the nafs lawwamah and ideal self is the nafs mutma’innah. Nafs Mutma’innah is a complete ideal state which avoids acts that produce guilt to the utmost level. This state is not found in Freud’s psycho-analytical study.35

Ghazali, Iqbal, and Maslow give importance to the spiritual aspect of a personality which grows with moral values in relation to God as the views of these writers are in

28Dr. Muhammad Rafi-ud-Din, Ideology of the Future (Lahore: Dr Muhammad Rafi-ud-Din Foundation, 2008).
29Ibid., 8.
30Ibid., 9.
33Id is similar to nafs ammara, which stands for the self and the “I am-ness” and needs; ego, nafs lawwama and Self and others sense of belonging.
harmony with the verses of the Qur’ān. All the other Muslim scholars Shah Wali Allah (1703-1762), Imam Mawlud (1844-1905), Muhammad Rafi-ud-Din (1904-1969), Abd-al Hakeem (1960- ), Hamza Yusuf (1958- ) follow in their footsteps. However, as an atheist, Freud does not talk about relations with God, but considers it a psychological need of an individual to feel the presence of a fatherly figure. Furthermore, modern research-affirming Ghazali’s standpoint- concludes that “spiritual experiences” and positive psychology go hand in hand.

Articles written on Ghazali’s concept of personality, which provide outlines of the contemporary theories of personality include, “The Nature of Human Disposition: Ghazali’s Contribution to an Islamic Concept of Personality” by Abbas Husein Ali; “Islamic Environment in Child Development According to the Views of Imam Ghazali;” “Moral Character of Muslim Personality: Scale Validation” (2012). These writers investigate the signs of the ethical Character of a Muslim personality in the Qur’ānic context.

3. Difference between the Personality Traits Presented by Ghazali and Freud

Moustapha Safouan says: “In truth, we find treatises on the soul in Arabic works that evoke the Freudian division among the parts of the personality: id, ego, and superego.”

Id, the instinctive drive, is portrayed in pictures- on different websites - as a devil. It is known as al-nafs al’ammārah, nevertheless, al-nafs alʿammārah comprises the nature of the wild beasts, herbivore animals and devil. Nature of beasts is anger along with animosity, hatred, and aggression. Herbivore Animals eat, drink, sleep and have strong sexual passions. Devil is treacherous, fraudulent, a plotter and so on. A man is born with most of his characteristics, with desires that come with birth and some of them take roots

---

37Like relation with God, attitude towards people of forgiveness, gratitude, optimism, grit etc.
with the passage of time.\textsuperscript{43} \textit{Al-} nafs al’ammārah or \textit{Id} commands a person to satisfy his desires no matter what. Those who neither follow the norms nor have any sense of right and wrong, and are overwhelmed bestial self-will disparage any object of their desire.\textsuperscript{44}

Prophet Yousuf (RA) is quoted in the Qur’ān as saying:

\textit{وَمَا أَنْزَلْنَا عَلَى النَّفْسِ إِنَّ النَّفْسَ لََََََََََََُّمَّارَةُ بِالسُّوءِ إِلَّا مَا رَحِمَ رَبِِّي إِنَّ رَبِّي غَفُورٌ رَّحِيمٌ}

“And I free not myself (from the blame). Verily, the (human) self is inclined to evil, except when my Lord bestows His Mercy (upon whom He wills). Verily, my Lord is Oft-Forgiving, Most Merciful.”\textsuperscript{45}

Prophet Yousuf (RA) said so because he was young and he was afraid he might fall into temptation. But Allah saved him from wrongdoing himself. He was a righteous man, the son of a Prophet, and himself a Prophet in the waiting. Although, he did not give the credit of his righteousness to himself, but told the truth that one’s self calls towards evil and one falls into error if he does not receive help and protection from Allah. If one does something wrong and neither he feels guilty nor does he repent, it means he is ruled by nafs \textit{al-}‘ammarah or that one’s \textit{Id} part is in power.\textsuperscript{46}

Prophet Yousuf’s brothers were jealous of him and wanted to get rid of him and threw him in the well. They kept lying to their father until they encountered with their forsaken brother in full glory on the throne of Egypt. The mighty brothers were now weak and in need of Yousuf’s help for grain. They were also a prophet’s sons and had received the same moral training but were influenced by al-nafs al-‘ammara.\textsuperscript{47} They went astray, at least in their conduct with their step brother.

3.1. The \textit{Nafs} and The \textit{Id}

Yousuf Ali defines Nafs as soul, self, living person, will and good pleasure.\textsuperscript{48} All of these meanings can be derived from the Qur’ān.\textsuperscript{49} In contrary Ghazali defines \textit{nafs} as the

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{43} hunger, thirst, reaction towards the things against one’s desire, greed to survive and caring about ones’ life, sexual desires at the age of puberty. According to Freud even sexual desire are there from early years of age but are expressed in different ways. Oedipus complex is one of the expressions of this desire.
\item \textsuperscript{44} Al-Ghazali, \textit{Ihya ‘Uloom-id-Deen,} Vol. 3, Translated by Fazl-ul-Karim (Karachi: Darul Ishaát, 1993), 14; Sigmund Freud, \textit{ID and Super-ego.}
\item \textsuperscript{45} Yousuf 12:53.
\item \textsuperscript{46} Mufti Muhammad Shafi Uthmani, \textit{Ma’arif-ul-Qur’ān,} Vol. 5 (Karachi: Maktaba Ma’arif-ul-Qur’ān, 2008), 84-86.
\item \textsuperscript{47} Yousuf 12:53.
\item \textsuperscript{49} Al-Baqara 02:9, 44, 48, 54, 57, 155, 240, 265 (in the meaning of heart) and many more verses spread out in the Qur’ān.
\end{itemize}
comprehensive word for wrath and sexual passions.\textsuperscript{50} \textit{Id} (Instinct Drive) is the comprehensive word for all the instinctive desires. Freudian \textit{Id} is the reservoir of Libido. Mullahy and Strunk take Freudian \textit{Id} to the next level defining it as “the great reservoir of the libido and of the destructive instinct.”-- the compound of behaviors that are considered destructive by the majority of the civilized population.”\textsuperscript{51}

\textit{Eating}, drinking and sexual desires, according to Freud, are part of \textit{Id}. However, these bodily desires become part of \textit{nafs} as well.\textsuperscript{52} Ghazali gives \textit{nafs} the meaning of anger and sexual appetite. Like \textit{nafs ‘ammara}, instinct drive (\textit{Id}) demands a satisfaction of the belly and taste buds and satisfaction of sexual appetite. These two desires are closely linked as the prophet of Islam said, “if anyone can guarantee me (the chastity of) what is between his two jawbones and what is between his two legs I guarantee paradise for him.”\textsuperscript{53}

\textit{Al-nafs al-‘ammarah} means: prone, impelling, headstrong and passionate.\textsuperscript{54} It is inclined towards evil and if it is not keenly kept under control it leads to perdition.\textsuperscript{55} \textit{Id} and \textit{nafs al-‘ammara} are for the material world and Satan uses the worldly desires to drive man away from the “straight path” by instilling the fear of poverty by making obscenity and indecency more appealing. \textit{Id} will urge man to disregard fear in the attainment of pleasure through sin. \textsuperscript{56} Achieving the desired pleasure provides instant gratification but not contentment. The lasting bliss comes from following the rules whereas happiness only lasts for a little while.

Amber Haque is found to be disagreeing with Freud’s association of negative desires with \textit{Id}, declaring those the very nature of man.\textsuperscript{57} However, the same concept is found in the Qur’ān and Hadith. Confessing that human instincts are prone to negative desires calling to act upon. Despite God has blessed man with a control over his baser desires and follow the rightful manner to satisfy himself, basic needs are given along with the powers of restrain, shame etc.

3.2. Al-Nafs Al-Lawwamah and Ego

\begin{footnotes}
\item[52] When these three desires overwhelm a person they become destructive and prove to be hurdles in training of \textit{nafs} and elevation of a person.
\item[53] \textit{Sahih Bukhari}, To Make the Heart Tender (Bab-ar-Riqāq) 76: 41; Punishment of Disbelievers at war with Allah and His Apostle 82:799.
\item[55] Ibid., 1649.
\item[56] al-Baqara 2:268.
\end{footnotes}
If one has committed sins under some obsession, he feels ashamed and guilty afterwards, he repents and his nafs undergoes a change of status from al-nafs al-ammara to al-nafs al-lawwamah (rebuking self). In the Qur’ān Allah has declared al-nafs al-lawwamah as the nafs of a believer.\(^{58}\) On the contrary, the person trained enough to act in accordance with the commandments of Allah, finding peace in doing good and never giving up becomes al-nafs al-mutma’innah.\(^{59}\) Al-nafs al-lawwama works under fear of Allah and the Day of Judgement. It belongs to the pious. A long and continual practice of piety ushers a person into the state of al-nafs al-mutma’innah where one is happy with whatever falls on him be it positive or negative.\(^{60}\) In short al-nafs al-mutma’innah is the result of striving hard against one’s baser self for the pleasure of Allah and it is a reward from the creator for being righteous and going against the most cherished of the basic desires.

The second type of nafs with Ghazali is nafs lawwama. This type of soul is not content with the evil act but is in harmony with the commandments of Allah, however it is prone to slips and follies but it is not happy or proud of his omissions and errors. It feels immense guilt and repents for the mistakes.\(^{61}\) The second part of personality near Freud is Ego; which is there to keep the Id in check and forces it to act according to the norms.\(^{62}\) Id falls into self-destruction by seeking its desired pleasures, whereas Ego, on the basis of its moral decisions, helps in winning the long term success.\(^{63}\) Ego is the part of Id that can act appropriately to gain advantage from the world without putting one’s self or others under threat. Ego borrows its energies from Id and leads it to act in socially acceptable manner. According to Freud Ego is weaker than Id because Ego gets the power of action from Id. He gives the example of object cathexes that emerges from “instinctual demands” Ego takes motive and diverts attention of its libido to its self.” Ego is said to be the learner brain.\(^{64}\) \(\text{Ego has separated its self from one part of Id by resistance due to repression. Repression is not carried over into Id, the repressed merges into the remainder of the Id}.\)\(^{65}\)

\(\text{Ego creates harmony between the desires, society, and the super-ego (conscience).}\)\(^{66}\) Consequently, Ego faces three dangers, if it is suppressed for long it produces anxiety. Therefore, the Id driven ego, restricted by the super-ego, whom reality repels, brawls to

---

\(^{58}\) Al-Qiyamah 75:2.


\(^{60}\) Ibid., 87.


\(^{62}\) \textit{ID and Superego}, 7.


\(^{64}\) Ibid., 77.

\(^{65}\) Ibid., 77.

\(^{66}\) Ibid., 60.
control the monetary task of coordination between the three powers effecting it. Most of us can relate to it when we cannot suppress and express; such a situation makes the ego anxious in the real world.

Among the Egyptians those who adopt psychoanalysis use the term nafs instead of the Ego. Nafs is a spiritual term where God can play a role in the unconscious (la-shu’ur). Similar to Freudian Ego al-nafs al-lawwamah is the conscience which raises guards against the thought of evil actions preventing the thinker from committing it, and rebukes the sinner and makes him feel guilty.\(^{67}\) It can also be said that Ego is in harmony with the norms like nafs lawwamah. However, Freud’s Ego lacks the sense of morality which is the part of super-ego. However, nafs lawwamah, unlike Freud’s Ego, holds the sense of morality but like superego, it makes the person feel guilty for doing wrong.

3.3. Al-Nafs Al-Mutma’innah and Super-Ego

Unlike al-nafs al-mutma’innah, super-ego does not give one an ultimate sense of contentment. Its work is more like that of a policeman which persuades the ego to act within the confines of social morality. Super-ego consists of conscience and ideal self. Conscience makes one feel guilty of committing an act against the ideal self. Having acted as desired by the ideal self and shunning the desires of I\(d\) will give the super-ego feelings of pride.\(^{68}\) Al-nafs al-mutma’innah is not a constant state, only a few are able to achieve it; those are awliya (friends of Allah) and the Messengers of God. If a common Muslim falls into error and feels embarrassed due to the sin he committed and repents, it is due to al-nafs al-lawwamah; however, if it is protected from the pull of the desires and carries out commands of the Lord, it is al-nafs al-mutma’innah.\(^{69}\)

Al-nafs al-mutma’innah is the one that holds contentment and is in complete harmony with the commandments of God. It stays content in not pursuing the wrong and flourishes in doing the good. It holds similarity with the ideal part of the super-ego that gives a sense of pride to the one doing good. Al-nafs al-mutma’innah does not act according to the norms of the society. It acts according to the commandments of its creator and creator of the Universe, God. Those who act by His commandments will be addressed like, “O! nafs mutma’innah (content soul) return to your Lord well-pleased, well-pleasing.”\(^{70}\)


\(^{70}\)Al-Fajar 89:27-28.
disobedient ones would be regretting and saying only if they had sent some good deeds for the life hereafter."\(^{71}\)

The self is said to be ‘ammara, lawwamah or mutma’innah only when a thought is acted upon in a certain way.\(^{72}\) The difference between the Islamic and Freudian tradition is that according to the former God’s pleasure is gained through giving up of the sinful desires and intentions; whereas according to Freud a person becomes psychotic due to suppression of desires and guilt created by super-ego.\(^{73}\) However hope for forgiveness after repenting may save one from excessive guilt. As Prophet Yusuf is quoted to have said, “indeed my Lord is oft-forgiving Most merciful.”\(^{74}\) Jack Boozer and Strunk also reject Freud’s theory that people become neurotic because of control of super-ego and that to cure a person’s super-ego should be silenced. According to their religion (Christianity) negative activities cause more chaos and guilt, and “that only goodness leads to healing, freedom and to fullness of life.”\(^{75}\)

Heart, mind, soul, and nafs all work unconsciously together. Last action, that is the turn out of the unconscious or conscious thinking, determine the type of personality or the part of personality that is in power in a person. The Arabic term for “the unconscious mind” is “al-la shu’ur,” which is an idea deeply echoing in Islamic mysticism and suggestive of Ibn ul ‘Arabi’s work\(^{76}\) and that of Consciousness is “Shu’ur.”\(^{77}\) For preconscious or subconscious mind “taht-ash-shu’ur” can be used; which means under consciousness. Unconscious are the desires of the animal self, ego as Freud says works both in the consciousness and unconsciousness. Al-Nafs al-lawwamah works the same way. It is the conscience playing part before and after carrying out an act. It triggers the feelings of discomfort and anxiety at the thought of doing something wrong and is the source of guilt after committing a sin. Freud talks of conscience from the perspective of an individual, society, and culture. However, Ghazali and the other Muslim philosophers and theologians talk about conscience in terms of consciousness of God. Allama Muhammad Iqbal in Javed Nama, talks about both: the ego of an individual; where one sees the things according to his own likes and dislikes, and the light of God. According to Iqbal one is pure who can stand unshaken in that light.\(^{78}\)

Art thou in the stage of “life”, “death” or “death-in-life”,

\(^{71}\)Al-Fajar 89:24.
\(^{74}\)Yusuf 12: 53.
\(^{75}\)Jack Boozer, “Religion, the Id, and the Superego,” 324.
Invoke the aid of three witnesses to verify thy station,
The first witness is thine own consciousness—
---see thyself, then with thine own light
The second witness is the consciousness of another ego---
See thyself, then with the light of an ego other than thee,
See thyself then with God’s light---
If thou standest unshaken in front of this light,
Consider thyself as living and eternal as He!\(^{79}\)

Finally, we can say that, Freud’s and Ghazali’s types of nafs can alike be taken as traits of personality while switching between the three when a stable personality is yet to be achieved. As a whole Ghazali’s parts of personality are very similar to that of Freud’s parts of personality; however, \textit{nafs mutma’innah} or the contented part of personality is missing with Freud. Freud’s \textit{super-ego} does not achieve contentment. It is always on guard; which is the characteristic of \textit{nafs lawwamah}. \textit{Nafs mutma’innah} can only be achieved by going through much self-discipline. \textit{Awliya Allah} (friends of God) have achieved \textit{nafs mutma’innah} by much struggling against their self; whereas, prophets and messengers were gifted with it.\(^{80}\) As Iqbal states, one is unshakable if one is unshaken in God’s Light.

In “The future of an illusion” Freud lists out the ways people seek pleasure with or dull the pain they suffer through; however, he admits that all of those are effective only for some short period of time. Freud does not propose anything as a constant source of pleasure.\(^{81}\) Rather, at a number of places he is found admitting that religion may help people with such problems.\(^{82}\) It is stated in the Qur’ān:

\begin{quote}
\textit{الذين أملوا وطمئن كلوبهم يذكرون الله آلا يذكرون الله تطمئن كلوبهم}
\end{quote}

\textit{“Those who believe, and whose hearts find satisfaction in the remembrance of Allah: for without doubt in the remembrance of Allah do hearts find satisfaction.”}\(^{83}\)

This verse is generally talking about hearts finding peace in the remembrance of God. Therefore, it can be said that it is something Divine only, that can make a person contented because it is only divine that is flawless. Everything human changes with need and time, however mere belief in the divine and the unseen associated with Him, changes personality and bestow man with certain traits.\(^{84}\)

---

\(^{79}\)Ibid.
\(^{80}\)Ghazali, \textit{Ihya ‘Uloom ud Deen}, 4.
\(^{82}\)Ibid; \textit{ID and The Super-ego, Dissection of Personality}.
\(^{83}\)Al-Mominoon 23:28.
Similarly, Jack Bruce quotes from Professor Strunk that the concepts of ego and superego are rarely found in Psychology and, religious history sees it as an operational way of looking at a problem.85 According to him, “heteronomous laws, imposed by society or by God, do not help man particularly.” As a psychologist, Strunk emphasizes on training of super-ego of a person and internalization of factors making up the ego, at a very young age when will and intellect both are weak, he should be brought up in such an environment that the norms of the society and religion become “natural” to him.86

According to Freud, hunger, thirst, anger and sexual appetite are from Id. Id is the base of all the psychic energy. It is there by birth and works in the unconscious mind. Hence, according to Freud it is the primary element of personality.87 Similarly Ghazali says that eating, drinking sleeping and fulfilling sexual desires are the traits common among the humans and the animals. Hence, this point again impresses upon the claim that Id is same as nafs ‘ammara. As nafs ‘ammara is defined as the animal self.

However, in Totem and Taboo, Freud gives the three stages of personality which take shifts; animism, that was natural and self-evident in the ancient man, takes the form of narcissism. The second is the religious stage where a child depends on parents to find the object of satisfaction. The third is the scientific stage, where man is independent to explore the world for himself. This is the stage of his adaptation to the reality.88 Hence, the person who knows nothing but to fulfill his own desires will have the beastly and devilish characteristics to purely serve his own desires be it at any cost. Freud associates the religious stage to the nature of children, which authenticates the saying of the prophet of Islam that every child is born upon nature. His parents make him an Idolater, a Jew, a Christian or a Muslim.89

A religious man depends on God and calls upon Him for every need. Just as a child tries to please his parents, a religious man strives to seek God’s pleasure. On the contrary, according to Ghazali religious stage of a man is when he is able to distinguish right from wrong. A man is accompanied both by an angel and a devil. A man listens to the call of the angel and acts upon it so much so that he likes nothing but good and acts according to the commands of God.90

86Ibid.
87Sigmund Freud, The Ego and the ID, 10.
88Sigmund Freud, Totem and Taboo, 150.
89Sahih Bukhari, 23: 1292
Scientific stage, according to Freud, is the exploring stage to learn and adapt to the reality. According to Ghazali, it could be called the struggle between the angel and the devil that accompany a man. One that takes strength and motives of which are continuously fed gives the final mold to the personality. Either the personality becomes angelic or devilish.\(^91\) Hence scientific stage cannot have said to be the final stage as reality of this world will be different for every person. There has to be one universal reality in order to counter check the multiple realities. Only a divine religion can serve the purpose. Human beings are multiple, hence, the realities will be numerous but God has to be One to Give a universal reality.

4. Conclusion

Putting all together, there is much in common between the personality traits of Ghazali and Freud. *Id* and *al-nafs al’ammara* comprise the instinct drives having commonalities in animals and humans. *Ego* creates harmony between the desires, society, and super-ego.\(^92\) *Al-nafs al-lawwama* is an amalgam of the *Ego* and the conscience part of the *Super-ego*. Therefore like ego, *al-nafs al-lawwama* holds the sense of morality. It goes through the thought process and have the conscience before carrying out an act and experiences a gust of guilt after committing an evil act. If a person responds to *al-nafs al-lawwama* positively, he will abstain from wronging himself and the others and if the person carries out the evil act ignoring the conscience and feels guilty afterwards as well as repents for the committed wrong, it is *al-nafs al-lawwama*. However, if he considers himself right and is proud about it, then it is *al-nafs al-amnara*. Similarly, Molana Yousuf Khan\(^93\) said in one of his lectures that, *al-nafs al-amnara* is happy for swindling others, *al-nafs al-lawwama* feels guilty due to putting others in pain and, *al-nafs-al-mutma’innah* finds happiness in giving.

Contented trait of personality is missing with Freud that is called *al-nafs al-mutma’innah* with Ghazali and in the Islamic tradition. Freud’s *super-ego* does not achieve contentment. It is always on guard which is the characteristic of *al-nafs al-lawwama*. Freud’s *Id* works in the unconscious mind however ego and superego work in subconsciousness and conscious mind. Super-ego differs from *Ego* in a way that it works in unconsciousness too. Freud relates the learning process of the external senses, connected with the heart and mind, to the conscious mind. Heart, mind and soul are interconnected. They function together consciously, un-consciously and sub-consciously.

Bibliography


\(^{91}\)Ibid.

\(^{92}\)Ibid., 60.

\(^{93}\)Molana Yousuf Khan is a Scholar of Hadith at Jami’a Ashrafiyah.


—. *Chemiyā-e-Sa’ādat*. Translated by Fakhar-ud-Din Ahmad Siddiqui, Lahore: Shan-e-Islam. nd.


