

Analysis of The News Coverage on Axact Software Company and Bol TV Channel in The News International- Karachi from May 2015 to May 2017

Sehrish Rais Ahmed Hashmi^{1*}, Tahir Yousuf¹, and Dastar Ali Chandio²

¹ Department Mass Communication, Federal Urdu University of Arts, Sciences & Technology, Abdul Campus, Pakistan

²Department of Media and Communication Studies Shaheed Benazir Bhutto University, Pakistan

Abstract

The study “Analysis of the news coverage on Axact Software Company and Bol TV Channel in The News international- Karachi from May 2015 to May 2017 brings into focus newspaper coverage of the scam related to Axact Software Company and its upcoming TV Channel Bol. This study explores how The News International Karachi newspaper portrays and frames the issue of Axact and the BOL television network. This study also defined how newspapers give coverage without applying ethical, moral values of news. This study also discusses new media groups and related business rules set by the Pakistan Electronic Media Regularity Authority. The study finds a tendency in large media groups of the country to discourage the arrival of new media houses in the country. An environment of animosity between various media houses seems to exist that is further exacerbated in the absence of rules of the business set or vaguely set by the PEMRA. The study also reflects upon ethical reporting standards, especially when it comes to coverage of the issues related to the media industry itself. Fair reporting, right to reply, balancing of views, known and quality sources, and provision of truth seem to be alien values for such coverage. Anti-News is not only published but also proudly accepted and cherished by the editors.

Keywords: Axact scam, Bol TV channel, the News International Karachi.

* Corresponding Author: sehrish.hashmi@fuuast.edu.pk

Introduction

Background of The Study

Chief Executive Officer Shoaib Ahmed Sheikh launched Axact Software Company in 1997 in Pakistan. According to Axact Software Company's website, it provides education worldwide. Later this Software Company also launched a TV Channel in 2013. Axcat's customers are 40 million in six continents, 100 countries, and 1,300 cities with 25,000 workers." Dr. Tauseef Ahmed Khan stated later this Software Company also launched a TV Channel Bol in 2013.

Brief History of the News International

The News International-Karachi was launched on 11 February 1991 by Mir Shakeel -ur- Rehman, Jang group known as the largest print media group. The News International was their first English language morning newspaper and simultaneously published in Lahore, Karachi, Islamabad, and Rawalpindi.

AXACT SOFTWARE Company's TV Channel BOL

According to Axact and Bol TV Channel's website Bol is a complete media enterprise consisting of platforms that are important and relevant to our audience, including Television (News, Entertainment, and Sports) "This is our mission, and everything we do reflects this only this and nothing else, we work to be the number 1 with more than 50% of the revenues and profits of every global media market".

Dr. Tauseef Ahmed Khan, a senior journalist and columnist, stated that Bol TV Channel had no license; therefore, the management purchased two small Channels, Aks and Labaik, and their names were proposed to be changed. Jobs in BOL TV Channel were publicized immensely through advertising on social media, and print media, including Dawn, and Jahan e Pakistan.

Senior journalist Mazhar Abbas informed that Bol TV Channel management painted 20000' vehicles in Pakistan and labeled Bol TV for free for its advertisement.

Issue of Fake Degree and The Axact Software Company

Senior journalist Nazeer Lagari stated Fake-degree scandal relating to Axact Software Company appeared in New York Times (Walsh, [2015](#))

referring to it as "Fake Diplomas, Real Cash" he reported that Karachi-based Information Technology Company 'Axact' Software Company' runs massive diploma mills and sells bogus degrees worldwide. This scam was discussed immensely in Pakistani print and electronic media".

Interior Minister Chaudhry Nisar stated strict action against this fraud would be taken. Within 24 hours, the Federal Investigation Agency (FIA) raided Axact offices located in DHA Karachi, Islamabad, and seized computers and other equipment. Later, Chief Executive Officer of Axact and Bol, Shoaib Ahmed Sheikh, was arrested with his key employees.

Interior Minister Chaudhry Nisar Ali Khan announced, "the government of Pakistan had written a letter to the FBI asking for its assistance in investigating the allegations leveled by the NYT story."

Federal Investigation Agency took fast action and arrested the Chief Executive officer of Axact and Bol Shoaib Ahmed Shaikh along with other prominent colleagues and initially charged them with fraud and money laundering; later, the case was registered on public order by 420 and 468 referred to as fraudulent (Ali, [2015](#)).

Dawn News stated, "According to FIA sources, FIR (7/2015) was registered through Saeed Memon — the assistant director of FIA's corporate crime circle — on behalf of the state. The individuals named in the FIR were subsequently arrested and are in FIA remand until June 7."

"The FIR was registered under Pakistan Penal Code (PPC), and the accused have been booked under sections 420, 468, 471, 472, 473, 474, 477-A, 109, and 34. The FIR was registered under Pakistan Penal Code (PPC), and the accused have been booked under sections 420, 468, 471, 472, 473, 474, 477-A, 109, and 34."

Chief Executive Officer of Axact Software Company and Bol media group Shoaib Ahmed Sheikh was released on August 24, 2016, after being kept in custody for sixteen months in prison and a fine of five lac Pakistani rupees (Tanoli, [2016](#)).

Before the New York Times newspaper exposed Axact's scam news story, it was earlier published in an Indian newspaper Hindustan Times. This newspaper also stated owner of Axact Software Company, Shoaib Ahmed Shaikh is a fraud and sells counterfeit degrees. Additionally, Hindustan Times published that a sensitive government organization is

launching Bol TV Channel in Pakistan, all media groups are afraid because of the arrival of Bol media, and it is hiring their senior journalists and famed anchors. Bol TV management took legal action against the Hindustan Times story and said Indian Newspaper was trying to defame Axact Company. Hindustan Times Clarified in its another story related to ISI and BOLTV Channel, in which Hindustan Times published apologize note related to Axact and Bol Channel, and removed "defame" exclusive report from their website (Lashari, [2013](#)).

Axacts's scam story exposed by Hindustan Time was also discussed in Mubashir Lucman's talk show, Khara Such. In his show, it was concerned that the "plot of the news story in Hindustan Times aligned with Bol Channel was a conspiracy of the owner of the Jang Group Mir Shakeel-ur-Rehman and relative of Jahangir Siddiqui, a recognized businessman of India and Pakistan. Both set a plan to scandalize the Bol media group. They made a deal with an Indian intelligence officer and a reporter for Hindustan Times to prepare a story in favor of the Jang group, opposing Bol Media group. Mir Shakeel Ur Rehman and Jahangir Siddiqui ordered the reporter to link this story with sensitive government organizations and spread it widely (ARY News, [2013](#)).

Dr. Tauseef Ahmed Khan stated that due to the Axact scam story, it is TV Channel Bol became a trending topic and centered among all media groups. Most of the employees of all media groups filled the application form of Bol TV Channel for getting jobs. According to media experts from all over Pakistan, two million Curriculum Vitae were sent from media employees, including different fields. Bol TV Channel approached prominent senior journalists, well-known anchors, and reporters and offered them heavy payments three times more than their current salaries.

Chief Executive Officer of Axact Software Company Shoaib Ahmed Sheikh "promised its employees to provide them lavish lifestyle and luxuries, transport systems, health facilities, and bonuses which none media group has provided so far".

Senior journalist Mujahid Barelvi stated that Kamran Khan was one of the leading journalists who left Geo news and became part of Bol TV Channel, following Asma Shirazi, Iftikhar Ahmed, and Mubashir Luqman, who teamed up with Bol TV media, and because of them joining, strong media groups felt economy fear. Bol TV Channel was hiring well-known

journalists, anchors, and senior staff from all over the media. As a result, Geo news and Dawn news and Express Dunya news started teaming up against Bol TV Channel.

"Star journalists started to leave their channels and seemingly pass into oblivion. They were actually gathering at Bol TV - a high profile print and the electronic media arm of Axt which had not yet gone on air."

After the New York Times news story about fake degrees and genuine cash spread in Pakistan, it affected Bol TV Channel; the newly formed channel started facing crises immediately. Well-known journalists and anchors heard an alarming bell and started leaving Bol TV Channel. Kamran Khan was the first one who resigned from Bol TV Channel and later joined Dunya news. "I discussed the situation with other senior journalists associated with Bol TV and would decide after reviewing the situation. Around four hours after the tweet, Kamran Khan announced a resignation from the channel. Many respected senior journalists associated with BOL TV reviewing situation threadbare will make judgment soon, truth must prevail."

Dr. Osama Shafiq stated closure of Bol TV Channel forced more than 2000 media employees out of their jobs. During this period, every worker of Bol TV Channel stood up for his rights, and all jobless employees were suffering dead ends; therefore, they protested in all cities of Pakistan and ran a signature campaign to lift the ban from Bol TV Channel.

Senior journalist Mazhar Abbas informed consolidated media groups were afraid of the arrival of Bol TV Channel because Bol TV Channel had set an exceptional standard of providing advanced systems, attractive salaries, and lavish facilities to its employee. No other media group could ever bring such fabulous changes to its familiar workers so far.

The downfall of Bol's TV channel caused its takeover. Salman Iqbal, Chief Executive Officer (CEO) of ARY Digital Network and owner of ARY Digital, decided to take over Bol TV's management. This move aimed to restore the jobs of thousands of employees, but it ended this agreement after a few months. (ARY Announces Bol TV Takeover, [2015](#)).

Sindh High Court restored all Bol TV Channel and Axt Software Company accounts. Bol TV Channel was supposed to go on air till the end of the year (Tanoli, [2016](#)).

Bol TV Channel started its regular transmission on December 25, 2016. In 2017 Bol TV Channel began to news and other programs in different local languages.

Dr. Jabbar Khatak informed that the content of Bol TV Channel does not have quality, and instead of doing journalism, Bol TV Channel is revealing weak points of strong and established media groups.

A well-known media personality Amir Liaquat Hussain is known as a rating star, joined Bol TV Channel; he did Ramzan Transmission and ran a show Aisa Nahi Chalayga which was once banned by PEMRA. Days later, Sindh High Court restored the program Aisa Nahi Chalayga and suspended the decision of the Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority.

In March 2017, Bol TV Channel launched another news channel PAK News, former General Musharraf joined PAK News and ran a show Sab say pehly Pakistan (Pervez Musharraf launches career as TV analyst, [2016](#)).

Problem Statement

In this study, an aspect of the investigation will be considered how and why The News International-Karachi published content on Bol Channel and Axact. According to media experts and independent researchers, Jang Group was afraid of this upcoming channel. Therefore, it took it as a rival and tried to lay down by extraordinarily publishing inaccurate content without including sources and highlighted this case in The News International-Karachi. During this research, the perspective of the investigation will be considered that printed material relevant to Bol Channel and Axact Company was aware of the issue or The News International-Karachi dealt with this media as a rival.

Rationale of the Study

The News International-Karachi is one of Pakistan's most circulated and prominent English Language newspapers. According to media experts, The News International-Karachi did not take care of news values and could not establish principles of journalism on Bol channel and the Axact scandal. This newspaper highlighted the Axact scandal more than any other newspaper. Therefore, this research will explore the why and how The News International-Karachi did so. Moreover, this study will examine the

issues of tiny electronic and print media groups' consolidation of large Groups' media concentration. Lacking PEMRA by setting no rules or policies for large media groups.

According to media expert Dr. Tauseef Ahmed Khan, Geo News takes Bol Channels as a rival and tries to lay it down. According to media experts, multiple points here, Axt Company had been working for the last 17 years, and no media Group had any dispute with it. Why did no political, social organization, media group, or government think about it? But immediately after the announcement of Bol Channel exact company got accused. These all things will be discussed and explored in this study.

Objectives

This study will examine all the news stories, editorials, cartoons, and narratives used in articles related to the issue.

- Quality of news content.
- Balancing of views.
- Collective narrative of the newspaper

Literature Review

Theoretical Framework

Framing Theory

For the study, framing theory has been selected. Framing theory focuses on how in mass media, relevant research work's coverage in the newspaper chosen is presented to its readers, which influences their choices about how to process that information because media has the power to effect immediate influence on the public.

Media plays an essential role in influencing the perception of the public. That is why readers have the right to know the fair structured messages on any issue presented in the newspaper, as it is essential for media to publish all the problems as same it is equally crucial how problems are shown, for observation of any point it is indispensable to know how the narrative of the particular matter is framed in the newspaper.

So framing theory will help towards the newspaper's narrative as well as on which subject of the issue newspaper focuses and emphasizes. With the help of the framing theory study will explore which information and investigative aspects of the study have been conveyed to the readers and

which specific news stories were necessary to include, but their exclusion has been observed.

In the light of framing theory, the study may tell the way Axtact scam is and how The News International-Karachi frames it to influence readers' understanding.

Research Methodology

The content analysis methodology is used for this study. The present research is qualitative, and multi-method is used to come to a reliable interpretation of the data and observations. "Multi-method research includes the use of more than one method of data collection or research in a research study or set of related studies."

Sampling

The study observes contents on selected pages of the newspaper. For the analysis, systematic sampling is used, and for keeping the newspaper's content, its front, back, and editorial pages are chosen because of their importance and impact. The scope of these selected pages included news stories, cartoons, articles, editorials, letters to the editor, etc.

While collecting data for the study, 730 editions were found in two years, excluding 6 holidays of All Pakistan Newspaper Society (APNS) each year, which has a total number of 12. Thus 718 newspapers were available for the study.

For sampling, every second day of the newspaper is included. After the selection of available 718 newspapers, 359 newspapers will be screened.

In 359 available newspapers, there were 1436 pages, including front, back, and editorials screened. Approximately 15 news items are published every day on the front and back pages. Thus 10770 news are filtered, and two editorials are posted every day; therefore, 718 editorials are screened, approx. Six letters to the editor are published on the editorial page, so 2154 letters to the editor are screened, four articles are posted on the editorial page every day, 2872 articles, and the newspaper publishes one cartoon daily, so 359 cartoons are screened.

Research Questions

For analysis of the study, two research questions were formulated, which aimed to address the following questions.

1. What are the predominant themes of published content in The News International-Karachi from May 2015 to May 2017?
2. How far do these themes contribute toward standards of fair and balanced reporting?

Five supplementary questions were formulated to gain valuable additional information relevant to the study for question number one.

With the help of these two research questions, the narrative used in news stories, editorials, cartoons, and articles related to the issue were observed. In the light of these two research questions, the quality of news content, balancing of views, and collective narrative of the newspaper was examined.

The News International-Karachi, from May 2015 to May 2017, studied on Fake degree scandal relating to Aexact Software Company and Bol TV Channel studied every second day of the newspaper and analyzed 359 newspapers. 1436 pages of the front, back, and editorial pages reviewed. After the study of 10770 news stories on front and back pages, 718 editorials, 2872 various articles, 2154 letters to the editor, and 359 cartoons on opinion pages were analyzed on fake degree scandal relating to Aexact Software Company Bol TV Channel in The News International-Karachi.

The total number of published content relevant to the study was 72. That included news stories 68(94.44%), three articles (4.16%), and only one (1.38%) cartoon. The News International-Karachi had not published an editorial and letters to the editor relevant to the topic.

The most published part of the total content remained news stories 68(94.44%). The News International-Karachi published 65 (95%) news stories on the fronts of its pages. A significant part of the news stories, 60 (88.23%) was published in single-column.

Findings

Dr. Ahsan Akhtar Naz observed that quality content is hardly followed in all newspapers, and he raised some facts about reporting and news editing in his book 'Sahafati Zimmedariyan.' Dr. Ahsan Akhtar Naz says most

newspapers do not use appropriate language and do not fulfill the responsibilities of journalism; news is published from an unreliable source even just to grab the attention of reading headlines that are not relevant to the detailed given information which is not accurate journalism.

Another Author agreed with the statement of Dr. Ahsan Akhtar Naz. Dr. Miskeen Hijazi ([n.d.](#)) wrote in "Pakistan Mein Iblaghiyat Taraqi or Masaail", media owners in our country have made journalism a business and deliberately forgot the ethics, responsibilities, and genuine role of newspapers. There was a time when journalism used to create awareness in public and never included any agenda so that an ordinary man could form his opinion through the newspaper, but now it is planned and cannot be called missionary journalism.

In his book, Dr. Shafiq Jalandhri ([n.d.](#)), an educationist in mass communication writer of Sahafat Sahafi our Iblagh, discussed press issues and journalistic ethics. The writer says now media is in the race of competition, doing nothing except increasing sensationalism and putting their own interest in the news, which left a negative impact on the public, no objectivity and fairness are found in journalism, but this is the responsibility of journalists to portray facts without fabricating news. Newspapers have become a toll of blackmailing. Most newspapers exaggerate information to make scandals which has decreased the standard of newspapers. Not only these newspapers are biased too, but all these elements also spread negative factors in society and are harmful to our national security. APNS played a better role in freedom of the press in an era of democratic government as compared to military governments.

The role of ownership in the creation and delivery of news content was analyzed by Maheshwari ([2015](#)). The researcher analyzed two English news channels in India. India Today and NDTV 24×7, and focused on ownership pattern, established role of ownership, quality of news content and influence of media ownership, and literature review was done on Altschull's theory 1984, he contends that "the content of the press is directly correlated with the interests of those who finance the press. And another theory of Shoemaker and Reese was included, this theory explains "media ownership and news content points out that the owners of a media organization have the ultimate power over the news content of the newspapers."

The researcher concluded that rules to prevent collective ownership and the media TV channel community's use in the request are prohibited. It's probably only owned by companies. Monopoly on the right, oligopolies (privately owned media), and the lack of diversity in media ownership or content are issues that are directly linked to questions of freedom of expression and media access.

Another research on media ownership was done by Apuke (2016), exploring the issues of media ownership and control in Nigeria. Oberoi Destiny Apuke studied and analyzed four kinds of media ownership and a pattern of significant media ownership in Nigeria.

1. Government ownership
2. Private ownership
3. Mixed ownership
4. Community ownership

The researcher examined that media ownership is always an issue in media discourse, and the type of practiced ownership determines the freedom and efficiency of any organization as well. As the laws of media patterns are essential to both media owners and media practitioners, he also identified the various media control mechanisms in society, in which advertisers' management, legal authority, and ethical control were included. The researcher found Government ownership and Private ownership are more critical than Mixed ownership and Community ownership, so it was recommended that both ownerships of Government ownership and Private ownership be freely practiced. Media should not be in the hands of rich people over the money of the poor.

Table 1

Total Published News Stories

Column-Size	News Stories	Front	Back
4 Column	1	1	
3 Column	3	3	
Double Column	4	4	
Single Column	60	57	3

Bylines' reporter Shakeel Anjum was the most published reporter who had reported 4 (17.39%) news stories.

34 (50%) news stories were reported from Islamabad as their dateline. Fake-degree scandal 20 (24.4%) remained the most published theme. A big part of the news stories, 65(95.58%), was published in 2015. Sources of 40(58.82%) news stories remained of correspondents. The content analysis showed newspapers gave only place and space to the study.

The most published themes remained fake degree scandal 20(24.4%) during the selected period, which became part of the discussion in news stories, articles, and significant pieces of one and only published cartoon. Analysis of the narrative explored that there were a total of 33 various themes highlighted in the total content of the newspaper and a full frequency of 33 different content observed as 82.

Thematic Distribution of Total Published Content related to Axact Software Company and Bol TV Channel in The News International-Karachi from May 2015 to May 2017, explained through tables. 33 themes have been mentioned in a table and categorized in three columns as highlighted themes, their total frequency, and percentage.

Table 2
Thematic Distribution of Total Published Content

Highlighted Themes	Frequency	Percentage
Axact Software Company	11	13.42%
Fake degree scandal	20	24.4%
Pakistan's reputation	4	4.88%
Bol TV Channel jobs	5	6.1%
HEC ranking details of Pakistani Universities	1	1.22%
The backing of military establishment	1	1.22%
False vision of Bol TV Channel	1	1.22%
Income of Axact	1	1.21%
Money laundering	2	2.44%
Proposing joint inquiry team	1	1.22%
Axact as a technology company	1	1.22%
Show cause notice	1	1.22%
Real owner of Axact	1	1.22%

Highlighted Themes	Frequency	Percentage
Fake degree laws	1	1.22%
Foreign currency account	1	1.22%
FIA raids	3	3.66%
Senior journalist saving Bol TV Channel	1	1.22%
Axact's bank accounts	3	3.66%
Finding of Axact main source of income	1	1.22%
Bol TV Channel's equipment	4	4.88%
Shoaib Sheikh's confessions	1	1.22%
Axact's tax exemption	2	2.44%
Shoaib Sheikh's Health	1	1.22%
Hawala hundi	1	1.22%
Axact's employees arrested	3	3.64%
Labaik Channel	1	1.22%
Axact's offshore companies	1	1.22%
Axact's charge sheets	2	2.44%
Fake degree victims	3	3.66%
Bail of CEO	1	1.22%
Axact's clients details	1	1.22%
Shares of Axact	1	1.22%

Discussion of the Results

Cartoons

The News International-Karachi published only one cartoon during the selected period. The newspaper discussed cheating and fraud of fake degrees scandal in it. Axact Software Company worked worldwide and looted many innocent students. This scam spoiled the image of Pakistan. The cartoon was published without the name of its cartoonist. This is a violation of journalism ethics because newspapers must publish the cartoonist's name.

Articles

The News International-Karachi published three articles relevant to the study; all three pieces were posted by different columnists.

Columnists discussed various themes related to Axact Software Company and Bol TV Channel in their write-ups. In a selected period, all four articles were published between May 23, 2015, to June 6, 2015.

The narrative of the three published articles exposed a multitude of facts. Based on these facts, some logical questions were raised, which proved these facts were weak and imbalanced.

The investigative aspect was not discussed in all three published articles; in-fact columnist did not raise any investigative question and did not include any statement from Axact's employees or the CEO of Axact. To make columnist statements facts fair and balanced, they should have added comments of Axactians. This makes clear the sense narrative of the published articles was an imbalanced and one-sided story.

News Stories

The News International-Karachi published 68(94.44%) news stories relevant to the study. The newspaper's narrative was best expressed on its front pages. Analysis of the news stories brought some facts that proved that this section's description did not follow standards of fair and balanced reporting.

Many news stories were repetitive. Sources of various important news stories remained correspondents. Interior Minister Chaudhry Nisar was the only politician to speak the most about this scandal.

The newspaper had published arrested news stories of Axact Chief Executive Officer Shoaib Ahmed Sheikh and his employees, but no news story was published upon their release.

The newspaper did not publish any statement from Shoaib Ahmed Sheikh and the current employees of Axact. Issuing their information could have balanced the narrative of the newspaper.

Essential information was missing in the newspaper's narrative that an Indian newspaper Hindustan Times reported Axact sold bogus degrees, on which Axact management took legal action against the newspaper. Later, Hindustan Times removed that report from the website (images attached in annex). The News International-Karachi did not include a reference to that report, which could have strengthened the newspaper's narrative.

Conclusion

Analysis of the narrative makes clear sense. The description adopted by the newspaper was a one-sided story. The News International-Karachi played the role of the judge in their reporting. Violation of Canon of journalism code of conduct and Council of Pakistan Newspapers Editors observed in published content relevant to the study.

Narrative related to the Axtact scam was imbalanced and weak. Moreover, proper protocols of reporting had also not been followed. All this lack proved that the report adopted by The News International-Karachi did not follow standards of fair reporting and failed to balance its views.

The study shows that the coverage of Axtact Software Company and Bol TV Channel in The News International-Karachi resulted from the economic war between the Jang group and Bol media group. Bol TV Channel claimed this would be the number one Channel in the Pakistani media industry. Therefore, they hired top rating hosts, anchors, and other staff from big media groups, including Dunya news and Ary News, Geo News, and express-news. Most of the big names of Geo news left geo and joined Bol TV Channel. Jang media group felt economic fear, so both rivals fought, and media employees had to bear this loss.

When the two years' coverage was analyzed in the light of formulated research questions, the newspaper adopted unfair and imbalanced reporting in the narrative of the fake degree scandal relating to Axtact Software Company and Bol TV Channel.

Recommendation

This imbalanced and biased narrative was adopted because of the economic war between the Jang media group and the Bol media group. So, it also calls for the government and Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority to reform and implement such laws that allow easy entry of new channels in the media industry and control the concentration of media groups.

To address issues such as these, there must be a press complaint system in Pakistan; Government and the newspaper industry should make it fully functional.

References

- Ali, I. (2015, May 27). FIR registered against Axact CEO, six others in fake degree scam. *Dawn*. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1184433>
- Apuke, D. O. (2016). Media ownership and control in Nigeria: an overview of the Marxist and pluralist theories. *Journal of New Media and Mass Communication*, 54, 31–33.
- ARY announces Bol TV takeover. (2015, August 18). *The Express Tribune*. <https://tribune.com.pk/story/940302/ary-announces-bol-tv-takeover>
- Walsh, D. (2015, May 17). Fake diplomas, real cash: Pakistani company Axact reaps millions. *New York Times*. <https://www.nytimes.com/2015/05/18/world/asia/fake-diplomas-real-cash-pakistani-company-axact-reaps-millions-columbiana-barkley.html>
- Fake Diplomas, Real Cash: Pakistani Company Axact Reaps Millions. (2015, May 18). <https://www.nytimes.com/2015/05/18/world/asia/fakediplomas-real-cash-Pakistani-Company-Axact-reaps-millions-columbianabarkley.html>
- Hijazi, M. (n.d.). *Pakistan Mein Iblaghiyat Taraqi or Masaail*.
- Jalandhri, S. (n.d.). *Sahafat Sahafi our Iblagh*.
- ARY News. (2013, October 28). *Khara Sach* [Video]. Dailymotion. <https://www.dailymotion.com/video/x16j64t>
- Lashari, J. (2013, October 28). *Hindustan times clarifies that its story about isi and bol tv channel in Pakistan, was wrong*. Unews TV. <https://www.unewstv.com/7643/hindustan-times-clarifies-that-its-story-about-isi-and-bol-tv-channel-in-pakistan-was-wrong>
- Maheshwari, M. (2015). *The role of media ownership in creation and delivery of news content: Case study of two English News Channels* (Paper presentation). International Conference of Communication for Social Change and Development: Imperatives and Constraints. Himachal Pradesh University, Shimla, India.
- Pervez Musharraf launches career as TV analyst. (2017, February 17). *Dawn*. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1317329/pervez-musharraf-launches-career-as-tv-analyst>
- Tanoli, I. (2016, August 24). Court acquits Axact CEO Shoaib Shaikh in money laundering case. *Dawn*. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1279678>