

UMT Education Review (UER)

Volume 5 Issue 1, Spring 2022


ISSN(P): 2616-9738, ISSN(E): 2616-9746

Homepage: <https://journals.umt.edu.pk/index.php/uer>



Article QR



- Title:** TVET Trainers Understanding of Engaging Instruction: Supportive Learning Environment for Work Integrated Learning
- Author (s):** Gouhar Pirzada
- Affiliation (s):** Lincoln University College, Petaling Jaya, Malaysia
- DOI:** <https://doi.org/10.32350/uer.51.01>
- History:** Received: September 13, 2021, Revised: May 18, 2022, Accepted: June 2, 2022, Available Online: June 21, 2022
- Citation:** Pirzada, G. (2022). TVET trainers understanding of engaging instruction: Supportive learning environment for work integrated learning. *UMT Education Review*, 5(1), 01-27. <https://doi.org/10.32350/uer.51.01>
- Copyright:** © The Authors
- Licensing:**  This article is open access and is distributed under the terms of [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)
- Conflict of Interest:** Author(s) declared no conflict of interest



UMT

A publication of

Department of Education, School of Social Sciences and Humanities
University of Management and Technology, Lahore, Pakistan

TVET Trainers' Understanding of Engaging Instruction in Support of Learning Environment for Work-Integrated Learning

Gouhar Pirzada*

Lincoln University College, Petaling Jaya, Malaysia

Abstract

The current study aims to explore TVET trainers' understanding of engaging instruction to ensure a supportive learning environment that leads to effective work-integrated learning. Initiating the training process has always been a challenging task for trainers because they have to engage the participants in order to teach them realistic work situations. Otherwise, both the trainees and the trainers are usually not satisfied with their learning environment. Moreover, their final training outcomes do not match with their work requirements. This research determines the trainers' understanding of engaging instruction under three main themes: supportive learning environment, work-integrated learning, and expected competencies of trainers. The existing gaps in theory and practice highlight the significance of the current research. Purposive sampling technique was used to collect data from 21 TVET trainers working in TVET institutes. Qualitative data analysis technique was applied to explore the participants' views, opinions, practices, challenges, preferences, and lived experiences. The analyses revealed the belief of the majority of trainers regarding the availability of a conducive environment for the trainees to enrich their learning experiences. Most participants were in favour of achieving the work-integrated learning outcomes by applying the KSA (Knowledge, Skills, and Attitude) approach. The findings were discussed from various perspectives and some suggestions were put forward based on the results, including an increasing focus on appropriate training strategies.

Keywords: engaging instructions, supportive learning environment, trainers' competencies, TVET, work-integrated learning

* Corresponding Author: mgipirzada@lincoln.edu.my

Introduction

The majority of TVET institutes' trainers are engaging learners to achieve high academic performance since last two decades. Although the other educational outcomes have become a challenge for them. Engaging instruction is an essential activity to grab learners' attention. It stimulates the learning process and impacts an academic performance. However, the educational researchers are still debating to define the phenomena of 'engaging instruction.' Mostly, the concept of engaging instruction includes complex ways that make it difficult to comprehend it in classrooms. While, some trainers focus on learning outcome strategies, others also take it as conceptual understanding (Ahmed, [2010](#)).

Moreover, educational scholars' support for the growth of instructional efficacy and designs was given importance in academic literature. Further on, their most common agenda was to engage instruction by providing better understanding and skill development for learners' education. Other factors were also identified to measure learners' engagement, including attendance records, assessments, interviews, observations, and self-reports.

Furthermore, TVET sector shows mismatch between the demand and supply because the quality and relevance are not as per the market demands. There is a limited number of collaborations among the private and public sectors regarding TVET governance and delivery. Pakistani government launched a reform to enhance the country's TVET system with the aid of European Union and governments of the Netherlands, Germany, and Norway in 2011. This program's first phase was based on the National Skills Strategy (NSS). In 2016, it accomplished the National Vocational Qualification Framework (NVQF), National TVET policy, and Competency-Based Training and Assessment (CBT&A). The second phase of the TVET Industry Support Programme, which began in 2017 and will run for another five years, will also achieve a number of important goals in the country's TVET sector (Technical and Vocational Education and Training [TVET], [2015](#)).

A European union, in collaboration with the national apex body in the country NAVTTC, is spending a small amount of money as part of the reformation program. The aim is to improve the county's TVET system and

structures and all the regional TVETs are the main beneficiaries of this initiative. (Pirzada 2020). The current study helps to explore and analyze factors assisting the growth and development of the TVET sector in Pakistan. Historical trends of technical education and the current situation of TVET institutes in the country are changing. It is evident that success cannot be achieved without improving students' understanding and skills development. This approach requires a mutual consensus among all provincial TVET providers, NAVTTC at national level, and all relevant stakeholders are involved in contributing to the development and implementing TVET reforms in Pakistan (Ahmed et al., 2020).

The present study looks into how trainers think about engaging training and contextualizing supportive learning environments for work-integrated learning. Administrators', learners', and trainers' experiences combine to provide a thorough explanation of the phenomena and a shared understanding of a positive learning environment. This study gives a deep understanding of how to engage learners through successful learner-centered tactics and serves as a useful resource for trainers to deliver engaging instructions, particularly in the TVET sector.

The Literature Review

Engaging trainees in a learning space has always been a challenging task for an instructor, a teacher, or a trainer. The most important aspect of the learning space is its discussion and the student's interest in the learning process. Therefore it is highly significant for an instructor and a trainer to understand learners' nature, necessities and expectations to maintain their interest in the learning process. Literature has shown that teachers are highly expected to amplify their learners' interest level by playing different roles like teaching, guiding, and mentoring. Therefore, the teacher's competencies significantly impact the attitude and behaviour of the participants (Reeve, 2013).

Work-Integrated Learning (WIL): Benefits for Students

Work-Integrated Learning (WIL) encourages the students to be productive and rational in their work for social and economic change. Their benefits are measurable for students, employers, and community members alike (Smith, 2012). When educators successfully and genuinely opt a

student learning approach keeping in view their real-life behavior towards studies, the benefits are multiplied. This results in value-adding, character-building, and future-ready graduates (Cooper, [2010](#)). WIL develops multiple skills in students such as teamwork, communication skills, meeting workplace expectations, interpersonal skills and observational theory and its practice. It also gives an opportunity to develop a range of personal attributes including interactive attributes, preparing career strategies, building a network of contacts, and enhancing employment prospects (Jackson, [2015](#)).

In the TVET sector, WIL projects are implemented to provide the students with a supportive learning environment that helps them in achieving successful careers (Orrell, [2004](#)). The students' overall learning process is positively influenced by such projects as they identify theoretical concepts, translate theory into practice, and develop communicative abilities in the students (Patrick, [2008](#)). The learning experiences gained by the students outside the classroom raise group spirits, develop cooperation, and contrive the decision-making power in them. These techniques help the students to develop better communication, decision-making, and problem-solving skills in them (Ferns, [2014](#)).

The students may obtain financial benefits, if the organizations start paying them for their projects or they can even earn cash as a result of their WIL experience (Orrell, [2011](#)). The trainers serve the students and the organization with their abilities and the benefits they gain from their portfolio evidence of job experiences. The increased job opportunities, ability to negotiate larger wage packages, development of career strategies, and the development of networks and relationships are all additional benefits. Effective case studies are designed and industry guest speakers are invited to bring about a positive change in students' learning through WIL process (Trede, [2012](#)).

Supportive Learning Environment (SLE): Placement for WIL

Trainers view work-integrated learning (WIL) placements as the most significant and influence on student's future career. Stakeholders are confused and unable to understand the expected outcomes of a supportive learning environment (SLE) (Martin, [2011](#)). It is viewed by the students as

a strength, an opportunity, a challenge and a threat. In an ideal world, industry, commerce, and government would approach educators and students with the offers of job placement in order to create a supportive learning environment (SLE) (Smith, [2009](#)). The responsibility comes from the workplace learning units, the trainers must be accepted and placed in different organisations according to their skills and knowledge (Thompson, [2010](#)). Organisations must ensure suitable principles for supervising trainers and to place them in relevant setting that would help to achieve their goals efficiently. In a WIL approach, the trainer controls all the interaction between the students and the organisation, including learners' visits, learning process, and their performance (Choi, [2011](#)). The efficient WIL model is the expectation from the students for their self-placement without the trainer, business or government placement that ensures student learning and performance during the placement (Lancaster, [2015](#)). The current study emphasizes on self-placement since it benefits the students. It requires him or her to consider plan and confidently contact an organisation to request, secure, confirm, and complete their WIL placement (Shabbir, 2009).

Teachers' Competencies for Creating SLE to Enhance WIL

There are multiple dimensions of teachers' competencies including field competencies, research competencies, curriculum or training content competencies, and lifelong learning competencies. It further consists of socio-cultural competencies, emotional competencies, communication competencies, ICT competencies, and environmental competencies (Hindman, [2013](#)). A trainer must know the role and competencies of TVET teachers. The trainer can fuel the learning and upgrading of the teachers with its knowledge and understanding of the current competencies. Moreover, professional development and curriculum studies are highly affected by the teachers' competencies (Selvi & Axiology, [2010](#)).

Usually, lecture rooms do not provide the skills required for entry-level workplace practice. These skills can be learned through exploring a combination of cultural capability, innovative thinking, and intelligent consideration in any globalised environment (Hodgson, 2008). Students must be provided with such skills which help them to find meaningful work. Furthermore, the aim of education is more than just finding work. Students are better able to engage themselves in critical thinking and transformative

learning through WIL programmes. Although there is a known conflict between academic goals and industry output, WIL programme must prioritise education (Elvira, [2016](#)).

Limited research is available for effective WIL, particularly in the TVET sector (Alias, [2005](#)). The main problem with WIL is its benefits for the learners and trainers, which are absolute but difficult to substantiate (Harper, [2019](#)). This issue needs to be resolved by proper research into unanswered questions. This research will help to answer those questions that need to be explored in the TVET sector and encourage a supportive learning environment (SLE) for work-integrated learning (WIL).

Research Objectives

- To explore TVET trainers' understanding of 'work-integrated learning' for engaging instruction.
- To explore TVET trainers' understanding of 'supportive learning environment' for engaging instruction.
- To explore expected TVET trainers' competencies.

Research Questions

1. What is TVET trainers' understanding of 'work-integrated learning' for engaging instruction?
2. What is TVET trainers' understanding of a 'supportive learning environment' for engaging instruction?
3. What is the role of expected TVET trainers' competencies?

Methodology

Research Design

The qualitative research design signified the detailed perspectives and thoughts of participants who were a part of this study. It was achieved by using a hermeneutic phenomenology research design. Semi-structured interviews were conducted to gather the participants' lived experiences and their interpretation of these experiences.

Research Context

Data was collected from 21 participants actively associated with the TVET sector. Their working experiences as trainers were kept in view during their selection process. Apart from their duties as trainers, all participants also performed substantial teaching or administrative roles in the TVET industry. The sample size comprised 13 male and 8 female trainers from Lahore, Pakistan'. Their varied experience spanned over two to twenty years in this sector. In the sample, 10 participants represented the public sector and 11 represented the private sector. Moreover, all of them were senior executives.

Sampling and Participants Inclusion Criteria

In Pakistan, there was little research conducted on the various elements related with examining a trainer's comprehension of engaging training. As a result, it became critical to gather the valuable ideas of trainers who had been working in this field for a long time and were familiar with their organization's many initiatives. Hence the purposive sample technique was used to target trainers from various technical and vocational colleges all around the country.

Data Collection Method

Semi-structured interviews were quite helpful in maximising data output and obtaining enhanced data to meet the objectives of various subject areas. Structured, semi-structured, and unstructured interviews were the three types of interviews (Bryman, [2016](#)). Unexpected interviewee behaviour was seen while conducting the interviews. Even though the researcher made appointments for consultations, she still had to deal with complications by rushing through certain sessions with the respondents. Due to a lack of time, the researcher had to deal with circumstances where respondents were rushing to get to the interview. The interviews were conducted via online application called Zoom, which is an internet video recording programme, during the time period of pandemic.

Data Analysis Method

Thematic analysis was used to analyse the data acquired. Thematic analysis is a method for detecting, analysing, and reporting patterns within

data in qualitative research (Braun & Clarke, 2006). The patterns emerged were assisted in identifying the important and common aspects. These were related with investigating TVET trainers' knowledge of engaging instruction, leading to the development of essential insights.

Computer-Assisted Data Analysis Software Package (CAQSAS) was used by the researcher for the data analysis. Qualitative data was susceptible and could be ambiguous at times, so NVivo was chosen later due to its easy access and knowledge of the researcher. As far as reliability and consistency had concern, multiple software like (e.g. NVivo, Atlas, AnSWR, and MAXQDA) were generally used for qualitative research data. The fact that could be noted here was that CAQDAS provided several advantages. Yet it was risky to use CAQDAS for this study due to the limited knowledge of the researcher. There was a chance that finite software could misguide researchers by its complex coding process and create ambiguity during data reporting.

Findings

Supportive Learning Environment

Role of the Supportive Learning Environment

All participants agreed on the vitality and critical importance of the role of a supportive learning environment (SLE). They all firmly believed that the productivity and results of any training were directly associated to the influential part of a supportive environment. They also indicated several factors and components that constitute the virtual learning environment for any training intervention. According to them, it could affect everything; the reputation of the trainer, organising agency, trainees' perception, and the learning process itself. For example, one of the participants said:

Environment indeed plays a prominent role in learning and trainees' perception of the importance of training. I believe the first impression of trainees is significant. For example, if it's a five-day training, participants will have an idea of the type of training activity they shall go through based on their first impression of the training venue and facilities. (Participant 15)

She also mentioned that the ambience needs to be clean and most importantly, all resources and gadgets need to work like multimedia. Finally, participant 21 added, “The training room must have good ventilation and it should not be too cozy to cause dizziness in participants.”

Participants also shared that having a supportive learning environment (SLE) should be the first focus for trainers. Some of them pointed to the comparatively lesser conducive training environments in the public sector occasionally. One of them said:

Things are still not upgraded in the public sector. I am not asking for a lavish venue, but it is challenging for the trainer to continue without essential training resources like the internet, multimedia, and computer systems. Unfortunately, in public sector TVET training venues, we sometimes have to deal with this situation. (Participant 14)

Trainers' Role in Developing Supportive Learning Environment

The majority of the participants considered the trainer's role essential and critical for developing SLE. They believed that although it is not the sole responsibility of the trainer and there are other parties involved too, but they believed that trainers should be on the top of the list of those stakeholders. Quoting one of the participants:

As I said earlier, I believe training is a wholesome activity organised and provided by the training institution with the most influencer role of the trainer. I don't confine it to the lesson plan and the theory or practical part of it. The institution has to provide the required type of technical input and resources, whereas the trainer is supposed to perform the most accountable role in the process. (Participant 1)

Participant 9 supported the same idea about the expected role of the trainer. She said, “The trainer has the primary role in planning everything about the training, starting from a conducive learning environment.” She also suggested that it required excellent coordination between the trainer

and other parties involved. Participants also shared the trainer's needed personality traits and social skills, which helped them better coordinate for this purpose. Quoting one participant:

Trainers should have a pleasing personality and accommodative nature with the ability to connect with people. They should be friendly and passionate about what they do and how they want to get the task done.
(Participant 7)

Role of Admin in Developing Supportive Learning Environment:

The majority of the participants believed that the trainer should not be solely accountable for developing the SLE, and the role and required input from the administration must not be undermined. They shared their good and bad experiences of working with the administration to develop a SLE of training activities. For example, one of the participants shared:

I have a habit of always checking the venue before the training, and I try to involve people from the admin too in the process. I think it's essential to involve everyone from the initial stage. Lack of coordination and not building rapport with the admin could be devastating. I once couldn't get printouts during the training because the admin person wanted to be given due protocols.
(Participant 17)

Participants also shared their experiences of doing extra work because trainers also perform the administration's role. Some of them stressed this point as they believed in some organisations, the trainer is presumed to be someone who could do and is supposed to do multiple roles. For example, one of the participants shared her training experiences with an NGO where besides all the trainer's jobs, she was not given any support with the administrative tasks, which affected her performance as a trainer. She shared:

I have never been objected to extra working because the ultimate goal is the success of the training.
However, it becomes complicated when you have to

indulge in administrative roles too. I was supposed to distribute stationery, shirts, USBs, and marking attendance too. The worst part is when you have to set the furniture yourself too. It becomes tiring and affects your core job task of training. (Participant 19)

Participants' Socialisation and Interaction with Each Other

The majority of the participants believed that the learning environment influences participants' socialisation and interaction with each other. They shared their personal experiences of giving trainees maximum opportunities to build their networking skills effectively. Most respondents believed that networking and participants' interaction were important steps to follow for trainees, and the process may become effective if trainers provide a cordial environment during the training sessions. Participants narrated the trainers' role to be crucial for letting this happen. One of the participants shared:

A trainer is like the king in the training venue with extensive autonomy and authority. Being a trainer, I try to engage participants together, starting from developing enjoyable ice-breaking activities to formative and summative group activities. The more participants get connected, the more they can enjoy. (Participant 3)

Another participant said:

As a trainer, we certainly have the power to turn average learning into meaningful, beautiful memories for participants. This is possible if participants are provided with keen attention, suitable activities, and the chance to interact with maximum people in the training room. (Participant 8)

Work Integrated Learning

KSA (Knowledge, Skills, Attitude) Approach in Training

A vast majority of the participants considered KSA to be the true spirit for TVET standardisation interventions. They firmly believed that contemporary international practices could not be understood and

implemented without following this approach. Participant 5 said, “It serves as a blueprint to the trainers for mapping the desired training outcomes before and during the training.” Participants emphasised the desired trainer’s balanced attention towards all three parameters; knowledge, skills, and attitude building of their trainees. One of the participants said:

The biggest reason for not doing so well in the TVET training sector in the past was not giving attention to the KSA approach. Trainers would only focus on enhancing knowledge areas, or sometimes, the whole focus would be given to building new skills. It is only now when TVET practitioners have realised that the success of any training depends on how smartly the trainer has handled all three parameters. (Participant 12)

Participants also shared their experiences about how their trainees react to the approach. Most of them shared that transferring knowledge is the easiest part, followed by developing skills, and what most difficult was to build the right attitude among training participants. Quoting one of the participants:

A training without following the KSA approach is useless in my view. Attitude building is the central area and most helpful in the whole KSA application. Our TVET graduates lack in this parameter, which is why it is hard for them to compete in international markets and locality. (Participant 9)

Role of OJT (On Job Training)

Most participants shared their views in favour of the OJT approach. They also believed it could add high value to the training intervention if participants learn in the training hall and experience the workstations. Participant 14 said, “Since TVET is all about technical, vocational and practical skills, the concept of on-job training greatly helps us meet the actual goals”. He further suggested a decent number of hours for the trainee to spend on the job instead of just a quick round of workplace or similar environments. Another participant shared:

On-the-job training makes the spectrum and scope of activity high. In my opinion, it should be a mandatory component rather than a choice. Unfortunately, we face difficulty in arranging such opportunities, because usually the industry is reluctant, and we do not have a compatible environment and resources available on training venues. I don't think even simulations can be a substitute. (Participant 21)

Most participants focused on the practical learning and realistic exposure OJT provided to trainees. They also shared that the new training objectives in TVET would not be met if this factor was ignored. One participant shared:

I have seen the traditional format of training where only theoretical aspects are focused. The true spirit of CBT (Competency-based training) is kept by giving the trainee hands-on experience in the actual work environment. Otherwise, it's like teaching people how to drive a car without making them sit on the steering seat. (Participant 4)

Engaging Participants in Specific Job-related / Occupational Skills

Most participants highly encouraged engaging their trainees in their job-specific tasks to allow them to work in their own sectors and instantly applied the new skills they learned in training. For example, one of the participants said:

I am specialized in digital design training, and only a part of it could be done on paper. Unless I do not engage my trainees to sit on machines and produce the design layout, the whole training concept is useless to me. Participants also want this and expect me to develop their digital skills. TVET training activities have to be specific and outcome-oriented. (Participant 11)

Participants also shared their experiences of engaging trainees in their sessions with tasks they were supposed to perform at work. They believed trainers were paid to build or flourish skills among trainees that added value to their performance and subsequently added to their profits. Referring to another participant's views:

We are only supposed to give an excellent talk on the training floor. The motivational part is essential, but the fundamental training element begins with participants building up their portfolios. Even the generic skills are taught in a way that participants have to apply these practically. If I'm giving them time management training, I will provide them with a template to plan their weekly tasks, and then I shall expect them to work on these sheets virtually. (Participant 18)

He also suggested that the actual training outcome is not obtained without engaging participants on the specific occupational skills.

Views about Online Training

A considerable majority of participants shared their views and experiences on the critical importance of online training in the TVET sector. In the backdrop of the current pandemic and its repercussion on education and training worldwide, online training was inevitable for the TVET sector to undergo. However, most participants experienced the online training mechanism to be highly different from the conventional face-to-face training activities. One of the participants shared her views:

There is a huge difference when I am training online than training physically. I have to use different strategies and methodologies. I have to learn new ways to engage instruction and ensure participants are with me throughout the whole time. It is challenging. I ask them to share photos and reactions like hand-raise on screen. The idea is to engage them continuously. (Participant 9)

She also shared her ways of having an online tea break with participants sharing photos of their teacups or victory signs. Another participant shared:

I firmly believe there is no escape for trainers now but to align with the online training methodologies. What is initially required is the mindset of acceptance by everyone, trainers, teachers, and students. Our students are labelled as Generation Z, who are pretty competent with online learning mechanisms. The focus needs to be given to the teachers and trainers. (Participant 7)

Considering the downside of online training activities and learning methodologies, most participants believed 'continuous learners' engagement' was the biggest challenge for trainers. Participant 10 shared his experience:

The most crucial issue for trainers with online training is trainees' engagement. My strategy is to keep asking questions randomly to all participants, and if someone doesn't frequently respond, I mark them absent. (Participant 10)

Expected TVET Trainers' Competencies

All participants expressed their views about the significant role that TVET trainers are currently playing and the nuclear part that they must contribute in the future to enhance the overall quality of TVET in Pakistan. They emphasised the up-gradation of knowledge and skills of trainers and exposure to the international practices, so they could accordingly train teachers. One participant shared:

Precisely pointing, trainers must learn the new skills, new techniques, and new practices for getting acquainted with the rapidly changing industry, including the latest equipment, industrial expectations, and marketing needs. Trainers must also be thoroughly familiar with the national TVET policy to transfer the right skills in the right direction. (Participant 3)

Participants also emphasised the need for TVET trainers to constantly upgrade their understanding of contemporary practices in light of the latest statistical evaluation of labour market data. Participant 8 added, “trainers who were inducted in the 1980s or even ’90s were now irrelevant, and this was one basic reason that trainers in the TVET sector had little to show as achievements”. He further suggested, “the shelf life of a TVET trainer is reduced unless the mindset of learning, unlearning and relearning is not adapted.” An emphasis on continuous learning and international exposure was commonly found among the commentary of the majority of participants. One of the participants stated:

The difference between a teacher and a trainer must not be confused. Like teachers need good trainers to show them the directions, trainers also need mentors with a broader vision to guide them and cascade learning.
(Participant 6)

All participants stressed on the prior understanding of contemporary concepts like (WIL) to be taught to trainers in the TVET sector. They believed that unless trainers' competencies were not excelled, it would be hard for TVET teachers and students to grasp the expected outcomes. One of the participants stated:

I can tell that most teachers in my institute do not even know what work-integrated learning is or basic concepts like demand-driven TVET. I believe these issues are included while developing the competencies of trainers who influence the teachers in TVET sector by cascading their learning. (Participant 17)

Discussion

Engaging trainees in a learning space has always been challenging for an instructor, a teacher, or a trainer. Students' involvement in the learning process is the most significant aspect of the learning area. As a result, it is critical for an instructor or a trainer to understand learners' nature, requirements, and expectations to retain their interest in the learning process. According to the existing literature discussed in chapter 2, teachers are put under a lot of pressure to increase their students' interest levels by

playing various roles such as teaching, advising, mentoring, and so on. As a result, the teacher's abilities considerably impact the participants' attitudes and behaviours, as evidenced by the results and recommended by the majority of participants.

TVET trainers must manage the diversity among training participants, and the engagement of senior participants has also been emphasized. This also encourages trainers to plan and execute activities that enhance the team work relationship between younger and senior age participants and men and women. The research data also emphasises that effective handling and management of diversity among training participants would help enrich the educational experience. It promises to allow the trainer to enrich their training portfolio. The more the enhancement of diversity management is applied, the better the trainer can engage training participants. The critical issue of encountering the training of participants who vary in their age groups is also dealt with effective diversity management. This encourages the trainer to design activities that cater to the needs of participants regardless of age, range of experience, and gender. It also reinforces simultaneously by engaging participants from the public and private sectors. Hence, the data also reveals the heterogeneous learning tendencies among training participants from both sectors. Although most trainers take religious backgrounds into account passively, there is a vast amount of acceptance and enforcement if trainers relate various content referred to in the Islamic context. However, it is prudent for trainers to be very thoughtful in selecting such references, which everyone accepts.

TVET to impact technical progress, employability and national development requires policymakers to focus on critical areas such as finance, access/participation, quality assurance and relevance of the program to the country's needs. Effective learning and training environments in TVET related training heavily depend on the instructor's attitude and performance. An effective training environment results in greater student engagement and better quality education (Akhuemonkhan & Raimi, [2013](#)). The current study significantly highlights the success of training to rely on an appropriate learning environment, allowing the trainer to engage in instruction effectively. A teacher's knowledge, skill, and attitude significantly contribute to developing students' behaviour and

engagement (Alenezi, [2012](#)). The presence of a conducive learning environment and its active connection with the role and responsibility of the trainer appears to be another major point of discussion. This issue is evident in participants' responses to the sixth section of the interview guide, that is, supportive learning environment. It is interesting to learn from this study that most participants believed, whether explicitly defined in terms of references or trainers' contracts, it is highly considered the most important aspect of a trainer to ensure a conducive learning environment. This becomes challenging at times since trainers do not have direct influence and control over administrative functions. Noteworthy, the absence of this desired conducive learning environment concretely damages the learning spirit and becomes harder for the trainers to achieve the required training outcomes. It is, therefore, important for trainers to consider their active-productive relationship and harmony with parallel administrative departments. It can relate to the availability of various resources to serve the individual as well as group needs. The scope of this issue has a challenging impact on the public sector institutions more than on their private-sector counterparts (Ahmed et al., [2020](#)).

Training in the TVET sector focuses on its indigenous characteristics and learning format. It requires strong and balanced attention to be given to all three aspects of any phenomenon under discussion, i.e. Knowledge, Skills and Attitude. This KSA approach lays the prominent foundation of learning for all stakeholders. Since the primary objective for TVET instructors is to train the workforce to meet labour market trends and demands and fully meet industry expectations. It stresses further to track the balance between imparting theoretical knowledge and conducting upskilling activities. The equation becomes less effective if equal attention is not given to building the learners' required attitude. The learner-centric approach along with the implementation of the KSA model has a better training impact on the students and has greater economic benefits and returns for the students (Houcine et al., [2019](#)).

Because a fundamental distinction between traditional TVET techniques and the newly acquired competency-based learning culture is that the latter focuses more on attitude building. Hence the trainers cannot overlook the importance of positively influencing participants' attitudes

(Alenezi, [2012](#)). The most popular ideas and global perspectives on sustainability, green TVET, and inclusive TVET all necessitate the appropriate mindset toward addressing these issues. Based on the conclusions of this study, Pakistan's TVET sector must prioritise the development of professional attitudes. Trainers have found this difficult to cultivate a mindset among participants that reflects worldwide trends and conversations. Henceforth promoting and strengthening Pakistani TVET, requires significantly more time. As a result, policymakers and decision-makers must establish a coherent link between diverse training efforts. A strategic thought process can tremendously assist the TVET fraternity in evolving with a global perspective in order to generate acceptable and employable graduates around the world. Pakistan, as one of the world's most populated countries with a majority of young people, cannot afford to ignore global employers' expectations and requirements. As a result, the KSA approach enables trainers to follow a strategic direction and means to reach their goal.

Teachers' abilities have an impact on students' attitudes as well as their performance. According to a recent study, teaching abilities impact student performance and assessments (Ilanlou & Zand, [2011](#)). Trainers want their participating TVET teachers to have exposure to these numerous competencies, as evidenced by the statistics. TVET trainers would not deliver an exceptional performance due to teachers' below-average skill levels.

The level of student engagement can be greatly reduced by the trainer's competencies and a learner-centric strategy. The learner-centric approach allows trainers to interact with trainees and build effective communication channels. The policy impact of a learner-centric strategy on student engagement is good (Mtika & Gates, [2010](#)). The emphasised findings from numerous questions about learning problems asked of participants also indicate the same viewpoints. As a result, TVET instructors should focus on developing and implementing learner-centered teaching techniques, which are also discussed in chapter 4. Trainers must consider their audience's limits and present a degree of comprehension.

There is a lower level of learning motivation among trainees, making it a stronger reason for trainers to avoid difficult assessments or training tasks.

Trainers must keep in mind an interactive strategy that adequately accommodates training participants' basic needs and requirements. An instructor can use a learner-centric approach to improve quality management procedures, student connection and engagement by using a learner-centric strategy (Buchanan, [2012](#)). Even though instructors' generic demands are quite similar in the TVET sector, there is variability among trainees based on their experiences, existing abilities, and current exposure to the best local and international practices. Trainee expectations and engagement differ from one industry to the next.

Participants and trainers can strengthen their bonds and participate more successfully with a learner-centric approach and activity-based training. Learners' motivation and participation in the learning environment are greatly improved by hands-on experience. Several research studies back up the validity of activity-based learning and its favourable effect on student performance (Prins et al., [2016](#)). In the TVET sector, activity-based learning (ABL) effectively deals with participants' boredom, lack of interest, and procrastination.

Furthermore, experiential learning aids the trainer in involving participants in the acquisition of critical and dominant industry-based skills.

As noted in Chapter 2, TVET trainers must manage variety among training participants, emphasising the participation of senior participants in age. Trainers must also create and implement exercises that improve the working interaction between younger and older participants and men and women. The study's findings also show that efficient handling and management of diversity among training participants can enhance the educational experience while also allowing the trainer to expand their training portfolio. The more diversity management enhancement is used, the better the trainer can involve training participants. The critical issue of encountering the training of participants who vary in their age groups is also dealt with with effective diversity management. This calls for the trainer to design activities that cater to the needs of participants regardless of age, range of experience, and gender. It also reinforces simultaneously engaging participants from the public and private sectors since the data also revealed the heterogeneous learning tendencies among training participants from both sectors. Although most trainers take religious backgrounds into

account passively, there is a vast amount of acceptance and enforcement if trainers relate various content in the Islamic context. However, it is prudent for trainers to be very thoughtful in selecting such references, which everyone accepts.

Recommendations

The current study points in several directions for future research into various facets of the TEVT sector. To begin, researchers interested in the complexities of both formative and summative training evaluations may want to look into the investigation of TVET training assessments used by trainers to engage instruction. Other researchers may want to look at the aspects of the TVET sector's training interventions that prompted and encouraged the difficulties raised in this study. Examining the post-training evaluation in determining the sustainability of learning and its application on the ground is one method. Secondly, semi-structured interviews are helpful in learning about the present state of the epidemic and participants' availability to conduct online sessions. Future studies, on the other hand, may take into account face-to-face research methodologies and observations made during training sessions to offer more value to such study themes. Thirdly, if future study is undertaken utilising the quantitative research methodology, a larger sample size comparatively with a greater number of responses can be obtained. There is room for studies regarding the attitudes and experiences of female. Despite their strong presence in the vocational sector, the number of female trainers is not particularly spectacular. Identifying the elements that encourage more females are beneficial. Finally, future study in specific trade/subject areas on the same issue of TVET trainers' comprehension of engaging instruction can be done. Each trade has its own set of features that instructors must note while instructing. Moreover a piece of study focuses on a single topic area can be quite interesting.

Limitations

Certain limitations are inherent due to the qualitative nature of this research study. This includes the inability to generalise the data findings and the relatively smaller sample size. It is generally believed that qualitative research studies lack generalizability, but it is also evident that

the phenomenon of verisimilitude also exists to an extent, and subsequently, the reader may experience similarities between the research findings and their own experiences.

During this research study, the most prominent limitation came from the pandemic and its effects on physically meeting the participants. Due to the lockdown situation and restrictions on logistics, all interviews were conducted online, using the zoom application. Although it benefited in gathering the video recordings to help in further stages of transcriptions, it was certainly not a substitute for physically meeting the participants and conducting face-to-face interviews with the physical human connection.

Conclusion

This study focuses on the need for positive interaction between trainers and trainees that cultivates a healthier relationship in a conducive learning environment. The role of the trainer is predominantly signified in enriching the learning experience and developing a supportive learning environment. The importance of effectively managing diversity is also highlighted in this research, where the trainers are expected to deal with different age groups, genders and organisational affiliations of their participants. The application of KSA (Knowledge, Skills, and Attitude) in a balanced manner is also emphasized by most participants in this study, as this approach provides the firm foundation of competency-based training in TVET.

It is hoped that the participants' detailed descriptions in this study will guide policymakers to improvise training practices in the TVET sector. It also provides promising learning opportunities to TVET trainers to enhance their training performances and productivity. Finally, it also offers thoughtful ideas for improving TVET training interventions in Pakistan's public and private sectors TVET for providing a supportive learning environment that leads to effective implementation of work-integrated learning.

References

- Ahmed, A., Wadood, A., & Mohammad, N. (2020). Tracer study of socio-economic and demographic impacts of technical and vocational education and training (tv et) for women in Baluchistan. *Pakistan Social Scineces Review*, 4(3), 824-838.

- Ahmed, P. H. (2010). *Building capacity of teachers and trainers in technical and vocational education and training (tv et) in sudan* [Doctoral dissertation, Technical University of Dresden-Germany]. Technical University of Dresden-Germany. <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/236366688.pdf>
- Akhue monkhan, I., Raimi, L., & Dada, J. O. (2014). Impact of quality assurance on technical vocational education and training in Nigeria. *Afro Asian Journal of Social Sciences*, 5(5), 1-25.
- Alias, N. A., & Rahman, N. S. N. A. (2005). The supportive distance learning environment: A study on the learning support needs of Malaysian online learners. *European Journal of Open, Distance and e-learning*, 8(2). <https://old.eurodl.org/?p=archives&sp=full&year=2005&halfyear=&article=185>
- Alenezi, A. (2012). *Faculty members' perception of e-learning in higher education in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia KSA*) [Doctoral dissertation, Texas Tech University]. Texas Tech University Libraries. <https://ttu-ir.tdl.org/handle/2346/45399>
- Bryman, A. (2016). *Social research methods*. Oxford University Press.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77-101. <https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa>
- Buchanan, J. (2012). Improving the quality of teaching and learning: A teacher-as-learner-centred approach. *International Journal of Learning*, 18(10), 345-356. <https://doi.org/10.18848/1447-9494/CGP/v18i10/47764>
- Cooper, L., Orrell, J., & Bowden, M. (2010). *Work integrated learning: A guide to effective practice*. Routledge.
- Choi, W., & Jacobs, R. L. (2011). Influences of formal learning, personal learning orientation, and supportive learning environment on informal learning. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 22(3), 239-257. <https://doi.org/10.1002/hrdq.20078>

- Elvira, Q., Beusaert, S., Segers, M., Imants, J., & Dankbaar, B. (2016). Development and validation of a supportive learning environment for expertise development questionnaire (SLEED-Q). *Learning Environments Research*, 19(1), 17-41. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10984-015-9197-y>
- Ferns, S., Campbell, M., & Zegwaard, K. E. (2014). Work integrated learning. In S. Ferns (Ed.), *Work integrated learning in the curriculum* (pp. 1-6). HERDSA.
- Houcine, B., & Zouheyr, G. (2019). estimating the economic returns of education in KSA by using mincerian earnings function. *International Journal of Economics and Financial Issues*, 9(6), 94-99. <https://doi.org/10.32479/ijefi.8659>
- Hindman, J., Grant, L., & Stronge, J. (2013). *Supportive learning environment, the: Effective teaching practices*. Routledge.
- Hodgson, D., May, S., & Marks-Maran, D. (2008). Promoting the development of a supportive learning environment through action research from the 'middle out'. *Educational Action Research*, 16(4), 531-544. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09650790802445718>
- Harper, K., & Temkin, D. (2019). Responding to trauma through policies to create supportive learning environments. *Child Trends*. https://www.childtrends.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/01/RespondingTraumaPolicyGuidance_ChildTrends_January2019.pdf
- Jackson, D. (2015). Employability skill development in work-integrated learning: Barriers and best practice. *Studies in Higher Education*, 40(2), 350-367. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03075079.2013.842221>
- Lancaster, S., & di Milia, L. (2015). Developing a supportive learning environment in a newly formed organisation. *Journal of Workplace Learning*, 27(6), 442-456. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JWL-08-2014-0061>
- Ilanlou, M., & Zand, M. (2011). Professional competencies of teachers and the qualitative evaluation. *Procedia-Social Behavioral Sciences*, 29, 1143-1150. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2011.11.348>

- Martin, A., & Hughes, H. (2011). *How to make the most of work integrated learning: A Guide for students, lecturers & supervisors*. Ako Aotearoa.
- Mtika, P., & Gates, P. (2010). Developing learner-centred education among secondary trainee teachers in Malawi: The dilemma of appropriation and application. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 30(4), 396-404. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2009.12.004>
- Orrell, J. (2011). *Good practice report: Work-Integrated learning*. Strawberry Hills.
- Orrell, J. (2004). *Work-Integrated learning programmes: Management and educational quality* (Paper presentation). In Proceedings of the Australian Universities Quality Forum (pp. 1-5). Victoria University.
- Patrick, C. J., Peach, D., Pocknee, C., Webb, F., Fletcher, M., & Preto, G. (2008). *The WIL (Work Integrated Learning) report: A national scoping study*. Queensland University of Technology. <https://eprints.qut.edu.au/216185/>
- Pirzada, G. (2020). Effect of including global TVET worldview in TIMT (TVET) (Institute Management Training) on vocational institute management in Pakistan. *TVET@asia*. http://tvvet-online.asia/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/05_Gouhar-Pirzada_Effect_2020-07-20_Vorlage-Final-1.pdf
- Prins, G. T., Bulte, A. M., & Pilot, A. (2016). An activity-based instructional framework for transforming authentic modeling practices into meaningful contexts for learning in science education. *Science Education*, 100(6), 1092-1123. <https://doi.org/10.1002/sce.21247>
- Reeve, J. (2013). How students create motivationally supportive learning environments for themselves: The concept of agentic engagement. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 105(3), 579-595. <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0032690>
- Selvi, K. (2010). Teachers' competencies. *Cultura International Journal of Philosophy of Culture and Axiology*, 7(1), 167-175. <https://doi.org/10.5840/cultura20107133>

- Smith, C. (2012). Evaluating the quality of work-integrated learning curricula: A comprehensive framework. *Higher Education Research & Development*, 31(2), 247-262.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/07294360.2011.558072>
- Smith, M., Brooks, S., Lichtenberg, A., McIlveen, P., Torjul, P., & Tyler, J. (2009). *Career development learning: Maximising the contribution of work-integrated learning to the student experience*. (Final project report). University of Southern Queensland.
<https://eprints.usq.edu.au/5401/>
- Shabbir, M. S. (2009, November). Supportive learning environment-A basic ingredient of learning organisation (Paper presentation). Proceedings 2nd CBRC, Lahore, Pakistan.
- TVET. (2015). *Pakistan technical & vocational education & training reforms*. TVET. <https://tvetreform.org.pk/>
- Trede, F. (2012). Role of work-integrated learning in developing professionalism and professional identity. *International Journal of Work-Integrated Learning*, 13(3), 159-167.
- Thompson, N. E., & Wheeler, J. P. (2010). Learning environment: Creating and implementing a safe, supportive learning environment. *Journal of Family Consumer Sciences Education*, 26, 235-246.